

## **The Validity of the Collaborative-Based Supervision Model Book to Improve the Principals Competence of SMA in Padang City**

Azvi Rahmi<sup>1</sup>, Prof. Nurhizrah Gistituati, M.Ed., Ed. D<sup>2</sup>, Dr. Rifma, M.Pd<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Azmi Rahmi, Universitas Negeri Padang, Fakultas Ilmu Pendidikan, Administrasi Pendidikan,  
azmirahmi53@gmail.com, ORCID ID

<sup>2</sup>Prof. Nurhizrah Gistituati, M.Ed., Ed. D, Universitas Negeri Padang, Fakultas Ilmu Pendidikan, Administrasi Pendidikan,  
icha-yp@yahoo.com, ORCID ID

<sup>3</sup>Dr. Rifma, M.Pd. Universitas Negeri Padang. Fakultas Ilmu Pendidikan. Administrasi Pendidikan.  
Rifmar34@gmail.com

### **Abstract**

This study aims to develop a Collaborative-based Supervision Model to Improve the Competence of Padang High School Principals. The type of research used is research and development (R&D) or (research and development) using a hypothetical model from Borg and Gall. The stages of the hypothetical model of this research begin with research and information (searching and gathering information), Planning (planning), Develop a preliminary form of product (product initial development). Preliminary field testing (field testing), Main product revision (product improvement). The source of the data used in this study was taken from the Principal of the Padang City High School with data collection techniques of observation, interviews, questionnaires, and documentation, while the data analysis techniques used qualitative and quantitative data. The results of this study indicate that the value of the Validity of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Book to Improve the ability of Principals Competence in the Senior High School of Padang city in the Content Feasibility category is 0.70 and is classified as valid. The value of the Validity of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model to Improve the ability of the Padang City Senior High School Principal in the Language category is 0.89. The reliability value of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Book Validation Instrument to Improve the ability of the Head of SMA Padang City for the Graphics category is 0.76. In other words, the collaboration-based Supervision Model Book product to improve the ability of the Padang City Senior High School Principal is valid.

**Keywords:** *supervision model, collaborative, high school principal competence*

### **Introduction**

Educational supervision has not been carried out well, indeed there are many studies on the supervision model, but the model has not been implemented properly (Sterrett, William L, et al. 2020). The school must always upgrade and respond to social, economic, and technological changes that are closely related to the world of education (Karen Rut, et al. 2015). In developed countries, teachers compete to improve pedagogical abilities based on the supervision received from school principals and school supervisors (Steele, Annfrid R. 2017). For that, we need good cooperation

between supervisors, principals, and teachers who teach in schools (Oja, Sharon Nodie. 2002). Currently, there are few regencies/cities in Indonesia that carry out the development of supervision with the existing benefits and facilities, and implementing supervision should be carried out in various ways. This is in line with advances in information and communication technology such as technology that is able to support the process of input and output data quickly and accurately, especially in the implementation of supervision (Watid Principle, 2017: 3).

Based on initial observations regarding the implementation of supervision, it shows as follows:

First, the assignment of education supervisors to carry out educational supervision by dealing with the excessive burden of nurturing teachers in high schools and schools caused the spread of high schools and schools to be targeted very broadly, but supervision of supervisors was very limited.

Second, supervisors still use conventional methods, it can be stated that supervisors come to schools and meet face-to-face with principals and teachers who are their mentors to explore various kinds of problems related to the learning process. The problem that often occurs is if at a predetermined time it turns out that one of the supervisors, principals, or teachers cannot fulfill their obligations because they are unable to attend school.

Third, the quality of management services in the Department of Education has not been effective, especially in the city of Padang, because services for career development for high school supervision will contribute or benefit the satisfaction and performance of education supervisors. Therefore, various regulations relating to the main tasks and careers of supervisors need attention from the structural officials of senior high school supervisors in Padang City, because job satisfaction, professional recognition, and the performance of education supervisors need to be improved by implementing a system of recruitment, placement, and personnel management competency development and career development.

The problems above greatly affect the implementation of supervisory duties, whether it is the task of high school supervisors in the academic and managerial fields. In the managerial field, if this problem is not addressed, it will greatly affect the national standards of high school education and the performance of senior high school leaders. Therefore, if this is not corrected in a long period of time it would affect the existing education system to higher levels of education. If the supervisory duties in the managerial field do not go well, it is possible that the quality of the SNP will not be achieved and the performance of high school principals in Padang City will be low, which will also affect the quality of teacher teaching. If the quality of teacher teaching is low, the quality of high school graduates in Padang City will be weak, if the quality of school graduates is weak, the input of prospective students to higher education will weaken.

In order to implement a good model, the school must collaborate with new types of management and supervision and teachers must feel confident and the principal as a leader must be able to convince educators with educational staff in their environment that supervision is needed from supervisors who have a new style in improving the quality of education in schools. (Tewel, Kenneth J. 1989). It is important to design a model of educational supervision so that schools become more professional

# The Validity of the Collaborative-Based Supervision Model Book to Improve the Principals Competence of SMA in Padang City

and develop in accordance with educational goals (Silva, et al. 2001), (Nicklaus, Janice; Ebmeier, Howard. 1999).

Based on the description above, the researchers are very interested in designing and making a collaborative-based supervision model for the head of SMA Padang City. A model design without time, place, and distance limitations can minimize difficulties, problems, and obstacles in carrying out supervision activities at Padang City High School.

Researchers plan to make the model and are expected to help the existing work process, by using a model that integrates parties related to the supervision work process. This supervision model facilitates the management of supervision, thereby helping to equalize the intensity and proportion of supervision activities in each school. In addition, this supervision model facilitates interaction between principals and teachers in distributing information, and the results of supervision.

## **Methodology**

The design of this research is a research and development (R&D) model of the Borg and Gall with the aim of producing certain products and testing the effectiveness of these products. According to Borg and Gall as quoted by Sugiyono, "educational research and development is a process used to develop and validate educational products" (Walter R. Borg, 1983:772). Educational research and development, which uses a process to develop and validate educational products. The results of research and development are not limited to the development of existing products, but also to find answers and knowledge of practical problems (Sugiyono, 2015: 28). The development model used in this study is a hypothetical model from Borg and Gall.

## **Participants**

Participants in this study came from supervisors and high school principals in Padang City

## **Data Collection Instruments**

The data collection techniques used in this exploration stage are:

### 1) Observation

Research observations at this exploration stage are direct observations which are used to find out: 1) real conditions in the field related to collaboration-based supervision problems, 2) real conditions in the field related to the causes of problems, so it is necessary to develop a collaboration-based supervision model to improve the competence of high school principals in Padang city. The research instruments used were recording devices, writing instruments, and observation guidelines.

### 2) Interview

The interviews used at this stage are in-depth interviews and are open or unstructured to provide space for more complete and in-depth data acquisition. Even though it is open or unstructured, researchers still use guidelines in interviews so that the discussion does not widen from the focus of the research. Interviews were conducted to obtain main data about a) real conditions in the field related to the problem of developing a collaboration-based supervision model to improve the

competence of Senior High School principals in Padang city, b) real conditions in the field related to the causes of the emergence of problems so that it is necessary to develop a collaboration-based supervision model to improve the competence of High School principals in Padang city. The research instruments used were recorders, writing instruments, and interview guides.

### 3) Documentation

The documentation used at this stage is all forms of written and unwritten documentation that can complement other data. The data collection instruments used were archives and documentaries at the research site.

### 4) Questionnaire

At this stage, the questionnaire was used to collect quantitative data, so as to determine the need for the development of a collaboration-based supervision model to improve the competence of Senior High School principal in Padang city.

## Findings

The results of expert validation show that the construction of the model book both in terms of appearance and language is in the very valid category. Table 1 shows the results of the validation of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model book to improve the ability of Senior High School Principal in Padang city.

**Table 1. Summary of the results of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Book Validation to Improve the ability of Senior High School Principals in Padang city**

No	Rated aspect	K	Category
1	Book construction	0,84	Very valid
2	Rational model	0,89	Very valid
3	Supporting theory	0,78	Valid
4	Collaborative-based Supervision Model Structure to Improve the Ability of Senior High School Principals in Padang city;		
	a.Syntax	0,83	Very valid
	b.Social System	0,89	Very valid
	c. Principle of Reaction	0,90	Very valid
	d.Support System	0,88	Very valid
	e. Interactional Impact and Accompaniment	0,84	Very valid
5	Learning process	0,85	Very valid

Based on the validation sheets collected from the validators, all validators stated that the collaboration-based supervision model book to improve the ability of Senior High School Principal in Padang city was in the very valid category. All validators agreed the model could be used with minor revisions, meaning that all aspects assessed were within acceptable criteria so that they did not require major revisions and re-validation.

The Validity of the Collaborative-Based Supervision Model Book to Improve the Principals  
Competence of SMA in Padang City

After validation by experts, prototype 1 was revised, followed by FGD. In table 1 the results of the FGD data analysis of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model to improve the ability of the Senior High School Principals in Padang city.

**Table 2. Summary of FGD Results of Collaboration-Based Supervision Models to Improve the Ability of Senior High School Principals in Padang city**

No	Rated aspect	K	Category
1	Book construction	0,86	Very valid
2	Rational model	0,74	Valid
3	Supporting theory	0,89	Very Valid
4	Collaborative-based Supervision Model Structure to Improve the Ability of Senior High School Principals in Padang city;		
	a.Syntax	0,89	Very valid
	b.Social System	0,80	Very valid
	c. Principle of Reaction	0,74	valid
	d.Support System	0,89	Very valid
	e. Interactional Impact and Accompaniment	0,86	Very valid
5	Learning process	0,80	Very valid

Based on the data of table 2, it can be seen that the assessments given by FGD participants for all aspects are in the very valid and valid category. Experts and practitioners at the FGDs gave very valid results, so the collaboration-based supervision test to improve the ability of the Padang I Senior High School Principal can be continued to the next stage.

Meanwhile, the results of the validation of model book products by experts can be seen as follows.

a. Aspects of Feasibility of Contents

**Table 3. Validation value of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model book to improve the ability of Senior High School Principal in Padang city toward the Content Feasibility category**

Aspect	V1	V2	K	Ket
Supporting theory	11	13	0.75	Valid
Syntax	48	64	0.76	Valid
Social system	27	38	0.61	Valid
Principle of reaction	32	35	0.80	Very valid
Supporting system	28	35	0.81	Very valid
Interactional Impact and Accompaniment	28	35	0.67	Valid
Model implementation	16	22	0.67	Valid
<b>Average</b>			0.70	Valid

Based on table 3, the value of the Validity of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Book to Improve the ability of Senior High School Principal in Padang city for the Feasibility Category is 0.70. These results show the level of consistency of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model

Book Validation Instrument to Improve the ability of Senior High School Principal in Padang city toward the Content Feasibility category is in the valid category.

b. Linguistic Aspects

**Table 4. Validation value of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model book to improve the ability of Senior High School Principals in Padang city toward the Linguistic aspects.**

Aspect	No. item	V1	V2	K	Ket
Symbol use	1	5	4	0.89	Very Valid
	2	4	5	0,89	Very Valid
Using Notifications and Terms	1	5	4	0.89	Very Valid
	2	5	4	0,89	Very Valid
<b>Average</b>				0,89	Very Valid

Based on the data from table 4, it is known that the value of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Validity to Improve the ability of Senior High School Principal in Padang city toward the Language category is 0.89. These results indicate the level of consistency of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Book Validation Instrument to Improve the ability of Senior High School Principal in Padang city about the Language category is in the very valid category.

c. Aspects of Presentation and Graphics

**Table 5. Validation value of the collaboration-based supervision model book to improve the ability of the High School Principals in Padang city toward the graphic category.**

Aspect	No. item	V1	V2	K	Ket
Book size	1	5	5	0.89	Very Valid
	2	4	4	0,89	Very Valid
	3	4	4	0,75	Valid
cover design	4	4	3	0.57	Quite Valid
Content design	5	5	4	0.80	Valid
	6	4	4	0,75	Valid
	7	4	4	0,75	Valid
	8	4	4	0,75	Valid
Average				0.76	Valid

The table above shows the reliability value of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Book Validation Instrument for Improving the ability of the Padang City High School Principal for the Graphics category is 0.76. These results indicate the level of consistency of the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Book Validation Instrument to Improve the ability of the Padang City Senior High School Principal in the Graphics category is in the valid category.

The Validity of the Collaborative-Based Supervision Model Book to Improve the Principals  
Competence of SMA in Padang City

The value of ICC (Intraclass Correlation Coefficient) or Intraclass Correlation is calculated using SPSS 17 for the model book. The following table shows the results of the calculation of Intra-class correlation from the model book.

**Table 6. ICC Value of Collaboration-based Supervision Model Books to Improve the Ability of Senior High School Principals in Padang city.**

Reliability Statistics	
Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
.768	2

Intraclass Correlation Coefficient

	Intraclass Correlation <sup>b</sup>	95% Confidence Interval		F Test with True Value 0			
		Lower Bound	Upper Bound	Value	df1	df2	Sig
Single Measures	.585 <sup>a</sup>	.963	.932	.726	2	2	.016
Average Measures	.768 <sup>c</sup>	52.694	.965	.726	2	2	.016

Two-way mixed effects model where people effects are random and measures effects are fixed.

- The estimator is the same, whether the interaction effect is present or not.
- Type C intraclass correlation coefficients using a consistency definition-the between-measure variance is excluded from the denominator variance.
- This estimate is computed assuming the interaction effect is absent, because it is not estimable otherwise.

Based on the data in the table above, it is known that the SPSS calculation for the ICC number obtained in the model book from all raters is high, namely 0.768. But if one rater is used, the ICC value becomes 0.585, which is quite high.

### Discussion and Conclusion

The results of the study show the analysis of the need for collaborative-based supervision development to improve the ability of Senior High School principals in Padang city, planning for supervision of high school supervisors. A good high school supervisor is a supervisor who has a vision for the future of his work. The vision is used as a guide for high school supervisors in carrying out their duties. The vision of high school supervisors must describe the goals to be achieved from supervisory activities (Sugiharto, 2018).

Vision contains an ideal general statement of a subject (TiIaar, 2002). So based on the planning for the formulation of a Collaborative-based supervision vision to Improve the Ability of the Senior

High School Principals, it has shown conformity with the supervision objectives to be achieved by the SMA supervisor. TiIaar (2002) mission is a statement related to the vision, if the vision states the basic objectives then the mission is the operational of the vision which includes aspects of the short, medium, and long term. In formulating the mission, it must be guided by the vision that has been made previously so that it can be described in the indicators to be achieved (Kiram, 2020). Based on the results of research and discussion of the Collaborative-based supervision mission to Improve the Ability of Senior High School Principals in Padang city, the collaborative-based supervision mission planning to Improve Senior High School principal's Ability is in accordance with the previously planned mission.

The validity of the development of collaborative-based supervision to improve the ability of Senior High School Principals is determined from the results of an expert review of the product and is an aspect that determines the quality of the collaborative-based supervision development research product to improve the ability of Senior High School Principals. Product validity includes content and construct validity. The content validity test shows that the developed model is based on a strong theoretical rationale. The theory underlying the development of supervision has been described in detail. Construct validity indicates that the developed model is based on state-of-the-art knowledge and internal consistency between product components.

### **Suggestions**

Based on discussing the results of the research on the Development of a Collaboration-Based Supervision Model to Improve the ability of Senior High School Principals in Padang city, it can be suggested to other researchers to continue the Collaboration-Based Supervision Model Development to Improve Senior High School Principal's ability from the aspect of practicality and effectiveness. Because in this study, testing the Collaboration-based Supervision Model Development to improve the ability of Senior High School Principal only reached the validity test stage.

### **References**

1. Aldi, N. 2014. *Pengawasan Pendidikan: Tinjauan Teori dan Praktik*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers
2. Asmendri, et al. 2018. "An Analysis of Managerial Competence of the Madrasah Principals in Islamic Senior High School in Tanah Datar." *Al-Ta'Lim Journal* 25.1: 56-70.
3. Barnawidan, Mohammad Arifin. 2014. *Meningkatkan Kinerja Pengawas Sekolah Upaya Upgrade Kapasitas Kerja Pengawas sekolah*, Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media.
4. Beach, Don M dan Judy Reinhartz. 2000. *Supervisory Leadership*. London: Allyn and Bacon.
5. Beddoe, Liz. 2010. "Surveillance or reflection: Professional supervision in 'the risk society'." *British Journal of Social Work* 40.4: 1279-1296.
6. Suhardan, Dadang. 2010. *Supervisi Profesional Layanan Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pembelajaran di Era Otonomi Daerah*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
7. Deliati, Nur Sakinah, dan Nadlra Naimi. 2019. "Development of Administration Quality In Madrasah Tsanawiyah 'Aisyiyah, Medan." *Budapest International Research and Critics in Linguistics and Education (BirLE) Journal* 2.3: 538-541.
8. Efrida, Efni, Benyamin Situmorang, and Eka Daryanto. 2019. "The Supervision Model of Principal in Improving Teachers Performance (Case Study at Madrasah Tsanawiyah Al-Muslimin in Tebing Tinggi)." *4th Annual International Seminar on Transformative Education and Educational Leadership (AISTEEL 2019)*. Atlantis Press.



# The Validity of the Collaborative-Based Supervision Model Book to Improve the Principals Competence of SMA in Padang City

9. Ellis, Michael V., N. A. D. I. A. D'Iuso, dan Nicholas Ladany. 2008. "State of the art in the assessment, measurement, and evaluation of clinical supervision." *Psychotherapy supervision: Theory, research, and practice* 2: 473-499.
10. Gamage, David Thenuwaradan Nicholas Sun-Keung Pang. 2003. *Leadership Management in Education*, Hongkong: The Chinese University Press..
11. Huda, Syamsul, dan Mohamad Muspawi. 2018. "Academic Supervision of Madrasah Supervisors in Improving Professional Competencies of Teachers." *Ta'dib: Journal of Islamic Education* 23.2: 155-163.
12. Karen Rut, et al. 2015. *Using Self-Study to Develop a Third Space for Collaborative Supervision of Master Projects in Teacher Education*. Studying Teacher Education. [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com)
13. Kiram, Yanuar, and BuchoriNurdin. 2020. "A Managerial Supervision Model in the Design Process for Madrasah Supervisors in Pasaman Regency." 2nd International Conference Innovation in Education (ICoIE 2020). Atlantis Press.
14. Knapper, Christopher K, and Arthur J Cropley, 2000. *Life Long Learning Higher Education*, Third Edition, London: Kogan Page.
15. Made Pidarta, 1999. *Pemikiran Tentang Supervisi Pendidikan*, Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
16. Memarian, R., and Z. Vanaki. 2012. "The effect of implementing clinical supervision model on the patient education outcomes." *Journal of Health Promotion Management* 1.3 28-36.
17. Muqowim. 2012. *Pengembangan Soft Skill Guru*, Yogyakarta: PT. Pustaka Insan Madani.
18. Nicklaus, Janice; Ebmeier, Howard. 1999. *The Impact of Peer and Principal Collaborative Supervision on Teachers' Trust, Commitment, Desire for Collaboration, and Efficacy*. *Journal of Curriculum and Supervision*, v14 n4 p351-78. [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com)
19. Nurtain. 1989. *Supervisi Pengajaran*, Jakarta: Ditjen Dikti Depdiknas.
20. Oja, Sharon Nodie. 2002. *Shared Accountability in Creating and Managing Collaborative Supervision Partnerships*. [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com)
21. Piet A. Sahertian. 2000. *Konsep Dasar dan Teknik Supervisi Pendidikan dalam Rangka Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta
22. Pidarta Made. 2009. *Supervisi Pendidikan Kontekstual*, Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
23. Rachman, Taufiq. 2011. *Sistem Analisis Administrasi dan Manajemen Suatu Tinjauan Teoritis dan Praktis*. Medan: Perdana Publishing.
24. Sahertian, Piet A. 2008. *Konsep Dasar & Teknik Supervisi Pendidikan; Dalam Rangka Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
25. Silva, et al. 2001. *Collaborative Supervision in the Professional Development School*. *Journal of Curriculum and Supervision*. [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com)
26. Siregar, Ahmad Husin, dan Yusuf Hadijaya. 2019. "Madrasah Headmaster Performance Strategy in Madrasah Al-Washliyah 22 Tembung." *Britain International of Humanities and Social Sciences (BIOHS) Journal* 1.2: 167-173.
27. Solikin. 2020. "The Improvement of School Principal Performance of SMP Sampang through Managerial Supervision." *International Research-Based Education Journal* 2.1: 9-14.
28. Sugiharto, D. Y. P., dan Ahmad Rifai Rc. 2018. "The Leadership of the Head Madrasah Based Quality." *Nadwa* 12.1: 15-26
29. Starratt, Robert J. 2007. *Menghadirkan Pemimpin Visioner: Kiat Menegaskan Peran Sekolah*, Terj. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
30. Steele, Annfrid R. 2017. *An Alternative Collaborative Supervision Practice between University-Based Teachers and School-Based Teachers*. *Issues in Educational Research*. [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com)
31. Sterrett, William L, et al. 2020. *Shaping the Supervision Narrative; Innovating Teaching and Leading to Improve STEM Instruction*. *Journal of Educational Supervision*, [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com)
32. Subandi. 2015. "Supervision Implementation in Management Quality: an Attempt to Improve the Quality of Learning at Madrasah Aliyah Darul A'mal Metro." *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam UIN Sunan Gunung Djati* 1.3: 446-461.
33. Syafaruddin & Nurmawati. 2011. *Pengelolaan Pendidikan, Mengembangkan Keterampilan Manajemen Pendidikan Menuju Sekolah Efektif*. Medan: Perdana Publishing.
34. Syafaruddin. 2004. *Manajemen Mutu Terpadu dalam Pendidikan*, Jakarta: Grasindo.

35. Syafaruddin dan Asrul, ed. 2014. *Manajemen Kepengawasan Pendidikan*, Bandung: Citapustaka Media.
36. Syahrul, et al. 2019. "Utilization of management information systems in managerial supervision at IAIN Kendari." *International Journal of Recent Technology and Engineering (TM)* 8.1C2: 392-392.
37. SyaifurahmandanUjiati. 2013. *ManajemendalamPembelajaran*, Jakarta: Indeks.
38. Soetopo, Hendiyat dan Wasty Soemanto. 1988. *Kepemimpinan dan Supervisi Pendidikan*, Jakarta: PT. Bina Aksara.
39. Sugiyono. 2010. *MetodePenelitianPendidikan: PendekatanKuantitatif, Kualitatifdan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta
40. Suryadi, Rudi Ahmad. 2018. "The Strategic of Managerial Supervision in The Forming of the Madrasah Work Plan." *EDUKASI: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 6.1: 001-0.
41. Tewel, Kenneth J. 1989. Collaborative Supervision—Theory into Practice. *NASSP Bulletin*, v73 n516 p74-83. [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com)
42. TiIaar, HAR. 2002. *Membenahi Pendidikan Nasional*, Jakarta: Rinekacipta.
43. Umar, Husein. 2008. *Strategic Management in Action*, Jakarta: PT. Gramedia.
44. Ummah, Rahmatul. 2018. "Improving Capability of Principal Preparing School Development Plan (SDP) Through Managerial Supervision with Monitoring and Evaluation Methods in Sub Rayon MTsN 3 Kota Medan." 3rd Annual International Seminar on Transformative Education and Educational Leadership (AISTEEL 2018). Atlantis Press.
45. Wahab, Abdul Aziz. 2011. *Anatomi Organisasi dan Kepemimpinan Pendidikan*, Bandung: Alfabeta.
46. Wahyu. 2020. "Concept of Supervision of Learning Process in Increasing the Quality of Education Results in Madrasah." *International Journal of Nusantara Islam* 8.1: 67-77.
- 47.** Walter R. Borg &Meredit D. Gall. 1983. *Educational Research: An Introduction*, New York: Longman.