

Digital Marketing for Competitive Advantage

Dr. Sanjay Bhāle¹, Sachin Mutha²

¹Indira Institute of Management, Pune-411033, India,

²Merops Consulting House Private Limited, Pune-411048, India

Abstract

Digital Marketing is continuously evolving field right from the start of the internet use. This article is a review of articles in academic journals, investigating possibility of competitive advantage that businesses can derive, using various e-marketing activities. 81 main articles published during 2005 and 2019 in various reputed journals on marketing/management fields were analysed including references to few latest articles. Findings reveal various aspects of competitive advantages in marketing that has received larger attention in management as well as marketing literature in recent years whereas a clear research gap for research dedicated to the adoption of digital marketing by small and medium businesses in India is found.

Keywords - Competitive advantage; Internet; Digital; Marketing; E-marketing; Management; Review;

1 INTRODUCTION

In this era of digital transformation, considering ever evolving digital technologies, moving from ‘web of content and context’ to the ‘web of things and thoughts’ (We, 2016) and their adoption by people; businesses must ensure use of data and technology for enhancing channel management, customer touch points, interactions, and many other processes (Hussein Ebied, 2018), in marketing domain. Investing in long term digital marketing initiatives gives huge competitive advantage (Eric Enge, 2016).

This article investigates mention of various competitive advantage businesses can derive with e-marketing activities.

81 articles published since 2005 to 2019 in various main journals devoted to management /marketing fields were analyzed. This article investigates into the aspects of possible competitive advantage in marketing that has received larger attention in both management as well as marketing literature in recent years.

The traditional 4Ps of marketing mix and modern 4Ps of marketing management (together coined here as [4P]²) are analysed, covering various marketing functions ranging from marketing strategy and research to sales-distribution and service.

2 E-MARKETING AND COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE: CONTEXT OF ANALYSIS

E-marketing word is often found used equivalent to internet marketing or digital marketing or online marketing. There are various definitions of e-Marketing. Cambridge

academic content dictionary defines e-marketing as the process of advertising and selling on the internet(We, 2016). E-marketing is also defined as planning and executing various marketing tasks in a computerized or networked environment(Gale, 2007). Digital marketing or e-marketing (somewhat broader in scope in comparison with internet marketing or online marketing, as it can also include e-CRM or Customer Data Management Systems) can also be defined as ‘applying technologies to market products and services or to support marketing activities or to achieve marketing objectives’(Dave Chaffey, 2015).

Based on above analysis of various definitions and linguistic usage, it can be commented that e-marketing scope can be said to be defined as the activities that include application of electronics and digital technologies aimed at achieving marketing objectives. Our analysis considers e-marketing as synonymous with digital marketing.

Competitive advantage, in the context of marketing and business can be defined as a specific ability over competitor(Kotler & Keller, 2018), a particular thing or condition making a business more successful than competitors (“Competitive Advantage | meaning in the Cambridge English Dictionary,” n.d.) or creating a novel value proposition(Michael E. Porter, 2017).

Supporting e-marketing adoption, it is said that constantly adding technology that gives competitive advantage is one of the ten commandments of marketing.

Over the years, adoption of high end technologies for creating competitive advantage, like big data(Donnelly, Simmons, Armstrong, & Fearne, 2015), Internet of Things(IoT)(Ng & Wakenshaw, 2017), e-CRM(Harrigan, Ramsey, & Ibbotson, 2012), machine-to-machine(M2M) communication (Daj, Samoilă, & Ursuțiu, 2012), and Artificial Intelligence(AI) (Draganov, Panicharova, & Madzhirova, 2018) have also found mention, even for implementation by SME businesses.

Researchers have written about competitive advantage using e-marketing technologies explicitly in which they are commenting on competitive advantage in the area of brand loyalty(Irem Eren Erdo mu and Mesut, 2012), product innovation and market driving(Kuncoro & Suriani, 2018), entrepreneurship competencies(Martin, Platis, Malita, & Ardeleanu, 2011), identifying customer preferences(Radu Ioan Mogoș, 2015), relationship marketing(Pereira, Ferreira, & Alves, 2012), service performance(Tsiotsou & Vlachopoulou, 2011), export performance(Navarro, Losada, Ruzo, & Díez, 2010), and many other aspects of marketing.

3 APPROACH TO THE REVIEW

Articles for review are taken from reputed journal publications during the years of 2005 – 2018 and partially 2019. This time frame is in line with other literature reviews published in scholarly articles. The research methodology can be described in three clear steps: (1) Selecting keywords and finalizing article search method (2) Selecting journals and articles for further detailed review purpose (3) Selecting a marketing domain framework for analysis.

Firstly, specific keywords such as marketing, e-marketing, digital marketing, internet marketing, online marketing, social media marketing, web marketing, digital transformation, competitive advantage, marketing capabilities, impact of technology, web

analytics, Search Engine Optimisation (SEO), social network are used to search for related articles using Google Scholar and Mendelay Search/suggestions facilities.

The articles which are from renowned publishers only are selected for further studies. Please refer to Table 3.1 for details. Articles suggested by Mendelay and Google Scholar based on context sensitive search interest are also considered.

In the second stage, all the articles are reviewed based on their title and keywords. The articles are then sorted in main categories viz. articles related to discussion about competitive advantage, various technology adoption models, e-marketing implementation case studies, and articles about marketing performance improvement.

Table 3.1
List of Selected Journals

Publishers	Article Count
American Marketing Association	2
Blackwell Publishers	1
Elsevier	25
Emerald Group Publishing Limited	16
IEEE	15
John Wiley Sons, Ltd	1
Macmillan Publishers Ltd.	1
Routledge Informa Ltd	1
sage publications, UK	1
Society for Marketing Advances	1
Springer	2
Taylor and Francis	1
WARC publisher	2
Westburn Publishers Ltd	1
Other	11
Grand Total	81

Total 81 articles mainly from prominent publishers like AMA, Elsevier, Emerald, IEEE, Sage, WARC and few others were selected for this review article.

At a third stage we were in need of a complete marketing domain framework, to ensure that maximum aspects of marketing management should be investigated for possibility of competitive advantage by adoption of e-marketing.

Based on a Philip Kotler publication of 2018, marketing activities as classically described using four Ps of marketing: product, price, place, and promotion; must be now amended with marketing management realities as people, processes, programs and performance as in Figure 3.1, to reflect modern day holistic marketing management scope. Both the frameworks of 4Ps' are selected for investigation which can guide this review article for finding out mention of various possible competitive advantages in marketing domain by adopting to the e-marketing.



- *People: Employees, Consumers and other Stakeholders*
- *Processes: Creativity, Discipline and Structure*
- *Programs: all the consumer directed traditional 4Ps activities*
- *Performance: financial and non-financial outcome measures*

Fig. 3.1. 4Ps of Modern Marketing Management

This framework of ‘4Ps of marketing + modern

Selected articles are examined in the light of modern marketing management covering majority of informational, strategic and operational marketing activities.

4 4P² REVIEW

While its exhaustive to investigate all the elements of marketing in one review, we have tried to accommodate what researchers have mostly been writing about during the study period selected. We have referred to the most suitable article supporting any construct established here, though there can be more than one references possible to some arguments mentioned here. It is suggested that ‘adaptation of latest marketing tactics by businesses can be seen as a key competitive strategy in marketing’ (Navarro et al., 2010). It is seen that majority of the articles those are selected for this review can be classified in 4 main categories –

1. Competitive advantages and capabilities (Please refer Table 4.1 for main concepts)
2. Marketing or business transformation with technology (Refer Table 4.2 for main concepts)
3. Search Optimization and Social media related (Refer Table 4.3 for main concepts) and
4. Firm and Marketing Performance related (Refer Table 4.4 for main concepts)

Following is the detailed investigation of specific techniques of digital marketing or E-marketing and various means of competitive advantage mentioned in few key articles.

4.1 Classic 4Ps of Marketing

Product

E-Marketing not only helps provide complete and convenient source of relevant product information(Chang, Rizal, & Amin, 2013) but also accounts for product innovation in various aspects of product as mentioned above. Also, Better marketing communication capability helps customer persuade positive perception of products and in turn help build differentiated brand image(Murray, Gao, & Kotabe, 2011).

Porter, in 2011, has recommended a continuous development in products by innovative use of technology(Qarri, Bazini, & Leskaj, 2011) which can be used as a competitive advantage for a business(Kuncoro & Suriani, 2018).

Companies are creating interactive platforms to allow consumers to choose the slogan/design/taste of future brand products or to create it themselves(Sharakhina, Girenkov, Skvortsova, & Glitsman, 2018). Collaborative design process makes it possible for customers to quickly give input into product design or they can design their own products. The designs can be tested and revised quickly or problems can be identified and rectified easily(David et al., 2014).

Thus, improvement in relationship capabilities improve product innovation and also product quality(Lages, Silva, & Styles, 2009). This kind of

Table 4.1 Summary of key articles examining Competitive Advantage

Key Concepts Covered	Key References
e-commerce adoption, competitive advantage	(Hamad, Haseba; Elbeltagi, Ibrahim; El-Gohary, Hatem, 2018), (Qarri, Albert; Bazini, Evelina; Leskaj, Bujar, 2011), (Ip, Crystal; Leung, Rosanna; 2011)
Market driving, product innovation	(Kuncoro, Wuryanti; Suriani, Wa Ode, 2018)
Cloud computing, digital marketing	(Radu Ioan Mogoe, 2015)
Adaptation of marketing tactics, competitive advantage	(Navarro, Antonio; Losada, Fernando; Ruzo, Emilio; Dez, Jose A., 2010), (Piercy, Niall, 2009), (Pereira, Carla Alexandra Barbosa; Ferreira, Joo Jos Matos; Alves, Helena Maria Batista, 2012)
Online media for personal branding	(Edmiston, Dawn, 2014)

Table 4.2 Summary of key articles examining Technology based transformation

Key Concepts Covered	Key References
Brand Communications, Digital marketing , E-marketing, Communication technologies, Abductive reasoning, big data, Market segmentation, consumer behaviour, electronic commerce,	(Yadav, Mayank; Joshi, 2015), (Ogunlana, Olawale; Cheng, 2009), (Ogunlana, Olawale; Cheng, Xiao Chun, 2009), (Sharakhina, Larisa V.; Girenkov, Artem; Skvortsova, 2018), (Semenov, V. P.; Budrina, E. V.; Soldatov, 2017), (Antti Pesonen, Juho, 2013), (Saren, Michael, 2011), (Ellis-Chadwick, Fiona; Doherty, Neil

E-mail marketing, Capabilities, performance, augmented reality, virtual reality, Multidimensional unfolding, Network data, Data mining	F., 2012), (Gerrikagoitia, Jon Kepa; Castander, Iigo; Rebn, Fidel; Alzua-Sorzabal, Aurkene, 2015), (Sarkees, Matthew, 2011), (Goneos-Malka, Amaleya; Grobler, Anske; Strasheim, Arien, 2013), (Mahony, Stephen O', 2015), (Persaud, Ajax; Azhar, Irfan, 2012), (Alemany Oliver, Mathieu; Vayre, Jean Sebastien, 2015), (Fulgoni, Gian, 2014), (Ho, Ying; Chung, Yuho; nam Lau, Kin, 2010), (Yan, Kuo Qin; Wang, Shu Ching; Wang, Shun Sheng; Lin, Yi Ping, 2011), (Barata, Gabriela M.; Viana, Julio A.; Reinhold, Olaf; Lobato, Fabio; Alt, Rainer, 2019), (Jaya, P. Jaya Mary A., 2016)
Sales force, selling methods	(Christ, Paul; Anderson, Rolph, 2011)
Packaging utility	(Subramanian, Kalpathy, 2017)
Customer insight, data analytics	(David, Merlin; Neil, Stone; Woodcock, David; Cummins, Shannon; Peltier, 2014)
Strategic marketing	(Group, Emerald; Limited, Publishing, 2013)
Retaining global customers	(Zhang, Jacky Xi; Zhang, Hongshi; 2014)
Business models	(Ng, Irene C. L.; Wakenshaw, Susan Y. L., 2017)
digital marketing, web analytics	(Bengel, Andy; Shawki, Amin; Aggarwal, 2015)
Market analysis, load balancing	(Bhende, Manisha; Avatade, Mohini S.; Patil, 2019)
Intelligent Agents, artificial intelligence	(Draganov, Mihail; Panicharova, 2018)
Emerging markets	(Figueiredo, Marco; Prado, Paola; Kramer, 2012)

Table 4.3 Summary of key articles examining Search Optimization and Social media

Key Concepts Covered	Key References
Competitive strategy, social networks, Social media, Promotion, Social metrics, Networking, Social marketing, Spreading scheme, Viral marketing, Targeted marketing, Web of trust, Online advertising	(Garrigos-Simon, Fernando J.; Alcam, Rafael Lapedra; Ribera, Teresa Barber, 2012), (Inversini, Alessandro; Masiero, Lorenzo, 2014), (Rayat, Amin; Rayat, Mehdi; Rayat, Layla, 2017), (Tiago, Maria Teresa Pinheiro Melo Borges; Verssimo, Jos Manuel Cristvo, 2014), (Domegan, Christine T., 2008), (Group, Emerald; Limited, Publishing, 2013), (Hansson, Linnea; Wrangmo, Anton; Silen, 2013), (Janett, Susan, 2013), (Lipsman, Andrew; Mudd, Graham; 2012), (Oliveira, Filipe; Santos, Antonio; Aguiar, 2014), (Yang, Jianmei; Yao, Canzhong; Ma, Weicheng; Chen, 2010), (Zhang, Yu; Wang, Zhaoqing; Xia, Chaolun, 2010), (Varnalieva, Jasminka; Sarkanjac, 2017)
E-Mentoring, entrepreneurship	(Martin, Catalin; Platis, Magdalena; Malita, 2011)
Email marketing, Individuals' social network, WOM	(Chang, Hsin Hsin; Rizal, Hamid; 2013), (Camarero, Carmen; San Jose, Rebeca, 2011)

Globalisation, ERP, IT	(Gen, Mitsuo; Kim, Kuinam J.; Huang, 2015)
Revenue models	(Enders, Albrecht; Hungenberg, Harald; Denker, 2008)
Emotion based e-commerce, sub-personality-based marketing	(Yamakami, Toshihiko, 2013)

Table 4.4 Summary of key articles examining Firm and Marketing Performance

Key Concepts Covered	Key References
Online reputation management (ORM), Professional services of marketing, Export performance, relationship capabilities, E-marketing performance, e-business performance, Customer linking, Marketing capabilities, Firm performance, Service capability, Channel coordination	(Hung, Ying Hsun; Huang, Tsong Liang; Hsieh, Jing Chzi; Tsuei, Hung Jia; Cheng, Chun Chuan; Tzeng, Gwo Hshiang, 2012), (Lages, Luis Filipe; Silva, Graca; Styles, Chris, 2009), (Shuai, Jia Jane; Wu, Wei Wen, 2011), (Tiago, Maria Teresa; Tiago, Flvio, 2012), (Vorhies, Douglas W.; Orr, Linda M.; Bush, Victoria D., 2011), (Trainor, Kevin J.; Rapp, Adam; Beitelspacher, Lauren Skinner; Schillewaert, Niels, 2011), (Wang, Shan; Mao, Ji Ye; Archer, Norm, 2012), (Yan, Ruiliang, 2010), (Murray, Janet Y.; Gao, Gerald Yong; Kotabe, Masaaki, 2011)
Ability to operate	(Thomopaulus, 2010)

product innovation positively influences sustainable competitive advantage (Kuncoro & Suriani, 2018). Additionally, the high end technologies like IoT (Internet of Things) helps transform static products into engaging digital services offers, helping consumer customization (Ng & Wakenshaw, 2017).

Since e-marketing helps open markets beyond boundaries, companies operating in international environment have to consider cultural differences when they design 'product package' for different markets of the world (Subramanian, 2017) and one of the article also mentioned as, firms who enter a munificent market are more likely to succeed (Wang, Mao, & Archer, 2012).

As far as packaging is concerned, researchers have found mentioning use of smart packaging such as robots transforming packaging in e-commerce, use of concealed RFID (radio-frequency identification) codes assisting protection from theft, connected medical packaging to track patients have been found at industrial literature (David, 2018).

Price

Effect of increased interactivity due to e-marketing on price is that prices can be easily tailored to different customers or customer segment (e.g. customers using specific credit card) (David et al., 2014).

Even while shopping in a physical store, Google Shopper or Amazon Sponsored Products, helps consumers to use their smartphone to immediately compare price, discounts and coupons while having a look at the product (Persaud & Azhar, 2012).

E-marketing helps reduce customer service costs (Brodie, Winklhofer, Coviello, & Johnston, 2007) while internet offers the benefits that provide consumers with an easiest method of finding the lowest price for any product (Fulgioni, 2014). Using search queries

or product comparison engines (which displays the range of prices for any product of interest), consumers can quickly navigate to the webpage of a shopping cart for lowest price available for the required product. Again, using display advertising revenues, social networking sites providers can offer services at lower prices(Enders, Hungenberg, Denker, & Mauch, 2008).

Thus, it has now become very critical that brands clearly establish and state a point of differentiation for their products and help justify a higher price in comparison with their competitors(Fulgoni, 2014). Various Online shopping cart websites are competing in India with promotional pricing strategies. As mentioned in one of the article, quality and brand orientation seems insignificant in India(Goyal, Maity, Thamizhvanan, & Xavier, 2013). This indicates how pricing strategies are much more important particularly in Indian markets.

One article on examination of effect of buyer feedback on final auction price on eBay, reported that negative feedback from buyers, inclusion of full warranties and acceptance of credit cards has direct co-relation with final auction price of a product(Zhou, Dresner, & Windle, 2009).

Again, availability of 'Big Data' as a by-product of the use of computer to solve any operational problem has resulted in more price oriented discounts and less advertising spends in utilizing marketing budgets(Fulgoni, 2014).

The mention of reducing sales staff levels and moving 'offline to online only' using information technology, benefiting business has also been found(Piercy, 2009).

Promotion

Authors have specifically written about sales and promotion in hospitality industry(Ip, Leung, & Law, 2011), tourism firms(Tsiotsou & Vlachopoulou, 2011) and professional athletes for association with their supporters(Evans & CT Smith, 2016). P. Christ in 2016, has commented in a chronological order on how salesforce has evolved and adopted technology over the years to increase sales and performance(Christ & Anderson, 2011).

Sales promotions using mobile apps have become fast and cost effective (Yadav, Joshi, & Rahman, 2015). Analyzing customer profiles and their preferences, customizing offers and sending an offer to a customer group with auto personalization on the fly has all become just a matter of click. Cloud computing helping data processing and storage has big influence on all the components of marketing plan including sales promotion(Radu Ioan Mogoş, 2015).

Using 'community managers' and 'virtual communities' not only for successful crowdsourcing but also for promoting new offers and brand reputation, has also found essential for SME businesses (Garrigos-Simon, Alcamí, & Ribera, 2012).

E-marketing campaigns can build long term brand equity by helping tap much larger community of customers and also can help make more informed advertising decisions(Fulgoni, 2014). Promoting marketing messages on internet helps reach millions of people in a very short time using search engines, web pages and AdSense like tools. Affiliate marketing and banner advertising are widely used on social networking websites for promoting a brand, products or services.

Since last decade, internet advertising has been rising and it's beneficial to users, customers, marketers and platform providers(Yamakami, 2013) and so has found a

unique impact while designing a marketing plan. Digital advertising market in India is expected to grow to 189 billion Indian rupees by 2020 (Business Standard, 2018).

A free photo sharing appeal using Instagram or a well-planned contest on Facebook can help a business do most successful research or marketing campaign (Hansson, Wrangmo, & Sjøilen, 2013). Mention of latest technologies like Augmented Reality (AR) have been also found in displaying of online brochures or product demos. And considering the discretionary factor of AR in the communications domain, most have referenced it to be of the characteristic of the public transport (Mahony, 2015).

One of the today's most popular method of online marketing is game-based-marketing which not only allows to share advertising materials but also help extract key information from players which is used by marketers to identify social profile of the player or even helps to define different clusters of consumer profiles (Oliveira, Santos, Aguiar, & Sousa, 2014).

Also, Online Reputation Management (ORM) can be considered the most synonymous term when it comes to traditional PR terminology and it is already critical to maintain corporate reputation in this digital age (Hung, Huang, Hsieh, Tsuei, Cheng, & Tzeng, 2012). Mention of various models like Decision Making Trial & Evaluation Laboratory (DEMATEL), Multiple Criteria Decision Making (MCDM) has been found in various articles, to be used to improve professional services of marketing for effective ORM.

Place

While smartphones have already become the first touch point to internet, optimizing a firm's internet presence for mobile is actually optimizing for the 'place' where prospects and customers are present. Virtual networks of Facebook or Twitter or any other popular network are becoming 'commonplace' for many major marketing communications (Goneos-Malka, Grobler, & Strasheim, 2013).

For the position at which a brand appears in search results displayed by search engine, advertisers may pay agencies for specific Search Engine Marketing (SEM) efforts (Abou Nabout, Skiera, Stepanchuk, & Gerstmeier, 2012). The place of a brand on 1st page in google search is thus the most sought after by companies now a day.

Implementing newest E-marketing technologies has been helping organizations reap benefits of using number of new marketing channels; such as e-mail marketing, affiliate marketing, contextual marketing, pay-per-click (PPC), search engine optimization (SEO), social media marketing (SMM) being most popular these days.

Presence on 'online selling and discussion channels' simultaneously, enhances online sales (Inversini & Masiero, 2014).

As far as transportation is considered, transportation chain has newly evolved reducing few layers of wholesalers and distributors, as online marketing and receipt of order has opened the direct-to-customer channel for many businesses.

Also, e-marketing helps share every product or service related information online with customer, reducing need of in person demonstration. Even though this has naturally created a competitive advantage for marketers, it has helped innovatively to heavy machinery manufacturers to expand beyond boundaries without the need for actual visits to the places for demonstration purpose (Christ & Anderson, 2011).

E-marketing adoption, enabling real time transactions and delivery systems has also

been found to reduce inventory cost for businesses(Hamad, Elbeltagi, & El-Gohary, 2018). The option of choosing a product from available inventory has also been an added advantage of technology(Ng & Wakenshaw, 2017).

Also, according to a research, online store environment significantly impact omniline trust(Bhalerao, 2020).

4.2 4Ps of Modern Marketing Management

People

Connecting with people who have some common interests has been made so easy with the use of social media(Group & Limited, 2013a).

Modern marketing deals with various data/ information handling systems. Marketers naturally can be less aware of latest updates in IT domain, making them feel various hurdles of adopting to IT for marketing(Saren, 2011). Thus training and upgradation of sales/marketing employees is one of the prime factors highlighted by many researchers(Ip et al., 2011). In the entire spectrum of job positions viz. support desk, customer service, copy-writers, programmers, trained people must be employed. Rightly motivated and capable employees are the Internal competitive advantage a business can have (Hung et al., 2012).

People generally share extraordinary observation and entertaining links while they don't like to share sad, horror or advertorial material(Irem Eren Erdo mu and Mesut, 2012). This clearly indicates what kind of communications marketers have to plan with their prospects. E.g. advertisements with perceived valuable information tend to be less avoided by people as they also seem to create less irritation(Chang et al., 2013).

Online comments affect people's perception towards a brand or organization, which marketers cannot ignore. Reviews of users may gain more weightage than an expert's opinion(Hansson et al., 2013) among internet users, today.

Also, customer network data made available to the marketers today precisely portray patterns of information flow in people and help them evaluate value of customers in their respective networks(Ho, Chung, & Lau, 2010). Many of the researchers have identified various motivations for bricks-and-mortar companies to invest in technology to serve virtual communities and to capitalize on the basic idea of bringing 'people' together(Enders et al., 2008).

One of the best views presented by an author is that companies don't talk, people do...so organizations must display their social pages as personal pages and use real photograph of a leader(Janett, 2013), to make it more effective.

Processes

'Process' in modern 4Ps as defined by Kotler in 2018, is a channel that brings all the creativity, discipline, and structure to marketing management.

Internet marketing helps improve traditional processes, replace traditional methods and create new tools within the sphere of marketing management(Tiago & Tiago, 2012).

The processes such as the sales funnel, a payment system or a distribution system, all are equally affected by digital marketing.

The key processes involved in digital marketing, in a different way identified by an author, are online behavioral advertising, influencer marketing and creating collaborative

environment(Radu Ioan Mogoş, 2015). So, Digital presence of a business helps improve information, knowledge, feedback, relationships, productivity and it also supports decision making process(Tiago & Veríssimo, 2014).

Actually, Organizational capabilities, as a unique and complex set of resources controlled in companywide processes, create competitive advantage. Pro-active firms invest at the right time to advance technologically to capture right competitive advantage(Sarkees, 2011).

Internet helps large scale personalization process, by allowing to reach millions and billions of people at a time like traditional mass media and additionally allows marketers to personalize the messages (Camarero & San José, 2011). With the video sharing channels such as YouTube and using right keywords, it has become possible for event organizations to reach to the people who were never on their email list. Also, leveraging on digital word-of-mouth has become much more cost effective than traditional methods(Yang, Yao, Ma, & Chen, 2010).

Also, involvement of customer in value chain process made possible by digital systems as explained in 1st P 'product' here, creates potential for customer empowerment (Saren, 2011).

A customer trying to reach a firm on phone may like to call a toll free number for any support assistance. Interactive voice response (IVR) powered toll free number helps companies to provide automated 24x7 supports to clients, prioritize calls based on importance or route the caller to the specific department as per need. This process of automatic channelizing callers is a huge competitive advantage over the traditional 'call-to-receptionist' telephonic helpline.

Programs

Marketing programs help build strong customer relationships. Few have also expressed it as a combination of multiple online or offline campaigns to be executed till the time it's beneficial to sales.

Researchers mainly found mentioning about marketing programs as various marketing communications and campaigns, sales promotion schemes, network optimization activities supporting retention of relationships, brand promotions, execution of loyalty programs and similar other activities.

Nearly 50% of the articles found written about some or the other marketing program. A well-defined marketing program helps put a formulated marketing strategy into practice.

Ability to do marketing campaigns coupled with some tangible benefits like offering free partial services, free Mp3 downloads(Irem Eren Erdo mu and Mesut, 2012), online distribution of gift vouchers to first 'x' customers, distributing freeware software to engage customers and to communicate special offers are a sure way of having competitive advantage in business. Digital coupons for customizing promotions to certain customer groups at a specific time can help save hefty amounts of otherwise printing and distributing coupons. Repeated business transactions based on customer loyalty programs can give sustained business growth (Yadav et al., 2015).

Online direct marketing programs offering some kind of monetary benefit seek easy interest in the advertisements from internet users (Chang et al., 2013) and marketing Programs with differentiated offers helping meet foreign customer needs can help obtain

competitive advantage (Navarro et al., 2010).

In a cluttered mass media market in this digital era, social media and mobile phones offer unique value proposition of privacy and personalization (Goneos-Malka et al., 2013).

Performance

Researchers have shown that, use of electronic channels for business and marketing activities has impact on companies financial performance (Ip et al., 2011) and also that firm's online performance is the reflection of its non-financial performance measures such as innovation and quality (Tiago & Tiago, 2012).

Use of e-commerce, irrespective of size of business, improves a firm's performance and competitive advantage (Hamad et al., 2018). Research also says that technology has positive impact on firm's key metrics of performance as market value, sales and profits (Sarkees, 2011).

The digital technologies have made performance-based compensation plans particularly interesting for advertisers because the internet has made it possible for easily tracking the number of times an advertisement appears, or it gets a click or it converts to a sell. (Abou Nabout et al., 2012).

In sales performance, technology has not only helped improve existing sales personnel performance but has also laid a ground work for future expanded roles and responsibilities (Christ & Anderson, 2011).

A brand followed by how many people on a social network has become an obvious performance metric for its online marketer, though it must be noted that marketers must not forget more meaningful financial performance measures (Wang et al., 2012). So, it is important for organizations to use a specific and well-studied metric system for performance measurement.

Though, web analytics is used by marketing managers to measure effectiveness of digital marketing in business performance very widely, very little academic literature is found referring to various metrics, suggesting newest engines, methodologies and improvements (Järvinen & Karjaluo, 2015).

5 DISCUSSION OF RESULTS

Articles are found directly commenting on competitive advantage and marketing capabilities of digital marketing practices, impact, influence or selection of technology. These articles covered impact on various marketing topics ranging from segmentation and targeting to evolving roles of sales people and international marketing. Few niche topics such as personal competitive advantage (Edmiston, 2014), mood-based e-commerce (Yamakami, 2013) and trust building are also found. One of the article also mentioned impact of digital marketing on product packaging design (Subramanian, 2017).

Empirical studies related to estimation of present level of technology adoption are found very rare, estimation of digital adoptability factor of an organization or industry sector and suggestions to improve the same are not found.

Researchers have mentioned about business or marketing transformation using e-marketing practices in few articles. Most of them have widely started focusing on very niche areas of technology in marketing like Artificial Intelligence (AI)/ Virtual reality

(VR), Internet of Things (IoT), Big Data, and Machine Learning after 2014.

Researchers mainly focused on promotional competencies aspect but impact on organizational management and marketing, entrepreneurship competencies, content, profitability, and revenue models are also found discussed. Researchers not found mentioning about paid social media associations and their authenticity, impact, and profitability for a business or possibility and implications of their adoption by businesses, specifically SMEs in India.

6. CONTRIBUTION TO ACADEMIC BODY OF KNOWLEDGE

The contribution of this study towards elaborating elements of [4P]² in marketing management in context to competitive advantage of digital marketing is useful in building on the body of knowledge, as it can help learners understand various possibilities and tools for creating competitive advantage to a business, in a single focused summary.

Commenting on traditional 4Ps as well as modern 4Ps of marketing management in a single article helps reader gets well connected to as many facets of ‘digital’ for ‘marketing’ as possible, readily organized in a universal marketing framework. This can sure help easily start building further concepts and detailed content, on the foundation already provided in this article.

The academic utility of this study is even more significant, as we have selected more than 90% of the articles published in premium academic journals.

7 CONCLUSION

This research work tries to consolidate what recent practices of digital marketing or e-marketing can suggest to today’s marketing managers, as per literature review and to comment on how it has transformed nearly every aspect and every process of marketing management, by leveraging technology.

Main focus of this article to connect to most of the digital marketing practices to both the 4Ps framework and thereby deriving gaps in the recent literature can said to be sincerely presented.

It can be concluded that, researchers have shown a growing interest in niche areas of ‘digital marketing’ these days. Even though, majority of the marketing practices and pertaining new technologies related to them have been found explored by researchers, few rarely found themes related to areas mentioned below demand attention by researchers in coming days -

- Re-organization of marketing department based on controls/relationships with digital consultants, experts and agencies
- Holistic digitization or transformation of existing business leading to economics of digital services in collaboration with industry experts
- Changes in requirements of compliance, competence and competitive advantage by organizations
- Implementation of digital marketing practices in SMEs and their present level of adoption in India
- Changes in sales management organization and latest product packaging practices
- Study and comparison of digital metrics in marketing as well as technical domain

with traditional metrics

Every literature review naturally has some limitations as all the research studies; that need to be mentioned. Firstly this review relies on keywords present in title, keywords and abstract of articles for their selection for this study. It is possible that few articles were not included due to not being found using the search terms we used. And, secondly, the articles in the period of 2005 to 2018 are only investigated.

References

1. Abou Nabout, N., Skiera, B., Stepanchuk, T., & Gerstmeier, E. 2012. An analysis of the profitability of fee-based compensation plans for search engine marketing. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*.29(1): 68–80.
2. Alemany Oliver, M., & Vayre, J. S. 2015. Big data and the future of knowledge production in marketing research: Ethics, digital traces, and abductive reasoning. *Journal of Marketing Analytics*.3(1): 5–13.
3. Authors, F. 2015. Big data?: qualitative approaches to digital research. *Choice Reviews Online*.52(10): 52-5109-52–5109.
4. Barata, G. M., Viana, J. A., Reinhold, O., Lobato, F., & Alt, R. 2019. Social CRM in Digital Marketing Agencies: An Extensive Classification of Services. *Proceedings - 2018 IEEE/WIC/ACM International Conference on Web Intelligence, WI 2018*.750–753.
5. Bengel, A., Shawki, A., & Aggarwal, D. 2015. Simplifying web analytics for digital marketing. *Proceedings - 2015 IEEE International Conference on Big Data, IEEE Big Data 2015*.1917–1918.
6. Bhāle, S. 2020. Enduring Industry Dynamics through Agile Business Strategy. *Indian Journal of Ecology*.47: 47–50.
7. Bhalerao, D. 2020. Impact of online and offline store environment on omnichannel trust in omni-channel buying of young Indian consumers: A conceptual framework. *Indian Journal of Ecology*.47: 71–74.
8. Brodie, R. J., Winklhofer, H., Coviello, N. E., & Johnston, W. J. 2007. Is e-marketing coming of age? An examination of the penetration of e-marketing and firm performance. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*.21(1): 2–21.
9. Business Standard. 2018. Indian digital advertising market to grow 32% to Rs 189 billion by 2020 | Business Standard News. *Business Standard*.
10. Camarero, C., & San José, R. 2011. Social and attitudinal determinants of viral marketing dynamics. *Computers in Human Behavior*.27(6): 2292–2300.
11. Chang, H. H., Rizal, H., & Amin, H. 2013. The determinants of consumer behavior towards email advertisement. *Internet Research*.23(3): 316–337.
12. Christ, P., & Anderson, R. 2011. The impact of technology on evolving roles of salespeople. *Journal of Historical Research in Marketing*.3(2): 173–193.
13. Competitive Advantage | meaning in the Cambridge English Dictionary. n.d. .
14. Daj, A., Samoilă, C., & Ursuțiu, D. 2012. Digital marketing and regulatory challenges of Machine-to-Machine (M2M) communications. *2012 9th International Conference on Remote Engineering and Virtual Instrumentation, REV 2012*.
15. Dave Chaffey. 2015. Definitions of Emarketing vs Internet vs Digital marketing.

16. David, B. 2018. Four technology trends transforming the packaging sector.
17. David, M., Neil, S., Woodcock, D., David, M., Neil, S., Woodcock, D., et al. 2014. Interactive, direct and digital marketing: A future that depends on better use of business intelligence. *Journal of Research in Interactive Marketing*.
18. Donnelly, C., Simmons, G., Armstrong, G., & Fearne, A. 2015. Digital loyalty card 'big data' and small business marketing: Formal versus informal or complementary? *International Small Business Journal: Researching Entrepreneurship*.33(4): 422–442.
19. Draganov, M., Panicharova, M., & Madzhirova, N. 2018. Marketing 5.0. Transactions of Artificial Intelligence Systems in the Digital Environment. *International Conference on High Technology for Sustainable Development, HiTech 2018 - Proceedings*.1–3.
20. E Jerome, M. 1960. Basic Marketing - A Global-Managerial Approach. *Homewood, Ill*.
21. Edmiston, D. 2014. Creating a Personal Competitive Advantage by Developing a Professional Online Presence. *Marketing Education Review*.24(1): 21–24.
22. Ellis-Chadwick, F., & Doherty, N. F. 2012. Web advertising: The role of e-mail marketing. *Journal of Business Research*.65(6): 843–848.
23. Enders, A., Hungenberg, H., Denker, H. P., & Mauch, S. 2008. The long tail of social networking. Revenue models of social networking sites. *European Management Journal*.26(3): 199–211.
24. Eric Enge. 2016. Sustainable competitive advantages in digital marketing. *search Engine Land*.
25. Evans, D. M., & CT Smith, A. 2016. Internet sports marketing and competitive advantage for professional sports clubs: bridging the gap between theory and practice. *International Journal of Sports Marketing and Sponsorship*.6(2): 9–21.
26. Fulgoni, G. 2014. Big Data: Friend or Foe of Digital Advertising? *Journal of Advertising Research*.53(4): 372–376.
27. Gale, T. 2007. E-Marketing | Encyclopedia.com.
28. Garrigos-Simon, F. J., Alcamí, R. L., & Ribera, T. B. 2012. Social networks and Web 3.0: Their impact on the management and marketing of organizations. *Management Decision*.50(10): 1880–1890.
29. Gen, M., Kim, K. J., Huang, X., & Hiroshi, Y. 2015. Selection of Digital Marketing Channels: Application of Modern Portfolio Theory. *Industrial Engineering, Management Science and Applications*.349: 585–597.
30. Gerrikagoitia, J. K., Castander, I., Rebón, F., & Alzua-Sorzabal, A. 2015. New Trends of Intelligent E-marketing Based on Web Mining for E-shops. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*.175: 75–83.
31. Goneos-Malka, A., Grobler, A., & Strasheim, A. 2013. Suggesting new communication tactics using digital media to optimise postmodern traits in marketing. *Communicatio*.39(1): 122–143.
32. Google. 2017. Consumer Barometer - Trending. *Google Consumer Barometer*.
33. google trends. 2019. e-marketing, digital marketing, internet marketing - Explore - Google Trends.
34. Goyal, A., Maity, M., Thamizhvanan, A., & Xavier, M. J. 2013. Determinants of customers' online purchase intention: An empirical study in India. *Journal of Indian Business Research*.5(1): 17–32.
35. Group, E., & Limited, P. 2013a. Facebook can transform your business: How one small

- start-up stimulates sales. *Strategic Direction*.29(9): 9–11.
36. Group, E., & Limited, P. 2013b. Mobile age provides marketing bonanza. *Strategic Direction*.29(8): 29–32.
37. Hamad, H., Elbeltagi, I., & El-Gohary, H. 2018. An empirical investigation of business-to-business e-commerce adoption and its impact on SMEs competitive advantage: The case of Egyptian manufacturing SMEs. *Strategic Change*.27(3): 209–229.
38. Hansson, L., Wrangmo, A., & Sjøilen, K. S. 2013. Optimal ways for companies to use Facebook as a marketing channel. *Journal of Information, Communication and Ethics in Society*.11(2): 112–126.
39. Harrigan, P., Ramsey, E., & Ibbotson, P. 2012. Entrepreneurial marketing in SMEs: The key capabilities of e-CRM. *Journal of Research in Marketing and Entrepreneurship*.14(1): 40–64.
40. Ho, Y., Chung, Y., & Lau, K. nam. 2010. Unfolding large-scale marketing data. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*.27(2): 119–132.
41. Hung, Y. H., Huang, T. L., Hsieh, J. C., Tsuei, H. J., Cheng, C. C., & Tzeng, G. H. 2012. Online reputation management for improving marketing by using a hybrid MCDM model. *Knowledge-Based Systems*.35: 87–93.
42. Hussein Ebied. 2018. Council Post: The Three Keys To Digital Marketing Transformation. *Forbes Communications Council CommunityVoice*.
43. Inversini, A., & Masiero, L. 2014. Selling rooms online: The use of social media and online travel agents. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*.26(2): 272–292.
44. Ip, C., Leung, R., & Law, R. 2011. Progress and development of information and communication technologies in hospitality. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*.23(4): 533–551.
45. Irem Eren Erdo mu and Mesut. 2012. The Impact of Social Media Marketing on Brand Loyalty. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*.58(1): 1353–1360.
46. Jacques, B., & Tanguy, C. 2019. 3 Digital Strategies for Companies That Have Fallen Behind.
47. Janett, S. 2013. HOW to BUILD YOUR BUSINESS BIGGER and STRONGER through SOCIAL MEDIA MARKETING. *Career Planning & Adult Development Journal*.29(3): 8–14.
48. Järvinen, J., & Karjaluo, H. 2015. The use of Web analytics for digital marketing performance measurement. *Industrial Marketing Management*.50: 117–127.
49. Jaya, P. J. M. A. 2016. Innovative Digital Marketing Trends 2016. *International Conference on Electrical, Electronics, and Optimization Techniques (ICEEOT) - 2016*.4882–4888.
50. Kotler, P., & Keller. 2018. *Marketing Management. Essentials of Management for Healthcare Professionals*.
51. Kuncoro, W., & Suriani, W. O. 2018. Achieving sustainable competitive advantage through product innovation and market driving. *Asia Pacific Management Review*.23(3): 186–192.
52. Lages, L. F., Silva, G., & Styles, C. 2009. Relationship Capabilities, Quality, and Innovation as Determinants of Export Performance. *Journal of International Marketing*.17(4): 47–70.

53. Lipsman, A., Mudd, G., Rich, M., & Bruich, S. 2012. The power of “like”: How brands reach (and influence) fans through social-media marketing. *Journal of Advertising Research*.52(1): 40–52.
54. Mahony, S. O. 2015. A Proposed Model for the Approach to Augmented Reality Deployment in Marketing Communications. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*.175: 227–235.
55. Martin, C., Platis, M., Malita, L., & Ardeleanu, M. 2011. The role of EMENTORING and social media for developing the entrepreneurship competences. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*.15: 947–951.
56. Michael E. Porter. 2017. *Creating and sustaining competitive advantage. Creating and Sustaining Competitive Advantage: Management Logics, Business Models, and Entrepreneurial Rent*.
57. Murray, J. Y., Gao, G. Y., & Kotabe, M. 2011. Market orientation and performance of export ventures: The process through marketing capabilities and competitive advantages. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*.39(2): 252–269.
58. Navarro, A., Losada, F., Ruzo, E., & Díez, J. A. 2010. Implications of perceived competitive advantages, adaptation of marketing tactics and export commitment on export performance. *Journal of World Business*.45(1): 49–58.
59. Ng, I. C. L., & Wakenshaw, S. Y. L. 2017. The Internet-of-Things: Review and research directions. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*.34(1): 3–21.
60. Oliveira, F., Santos, A., Aguiar, B., & Sousa, J. 2014. GameFoundry: Social Gaming Platform for Digital Marketing, User Profiling and Collective Behavior. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*.148: 58–66.
61. Pereira, C. A. B., Ferreira, J. J. M., & Alves, H. M. B. 2012. Tacit Knowledge as Competitive Advantage in Relationship Marketing: A Literature Review and Theoretical Implications. *Journal of Relationship Marketing*.11(3): 172–197.
62. Persaud, A., & Azhar, I. 2012. Innovative mobile marketing via smartphones. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*.30(4): 418–443.
63. Piercy, N. 2009. Positive management of marketing-operations relationships: the case of an internet retail SME. *Journal of Marketing Management*.25(5–6): 551–570.
64. Qarri, A., Bazini, E., & Leskaj, B. 2011. The impact of ICT use in competitive advantage in SME-s within service sector in Albania. *Journal of Information Technology & Economic Development*.2(1): 9–19.
65. Radu Ioan Mogoş. 2015. Digital Marketing for Identifying Customers’ Preferences – A Solution for SMEs in Obtaining Competitive Advantages. *International Journal of Economic Practices and Theories*.5(3): 240–247.
66. Saren, M. 2011. Marketing empowerment and exclusion in the information age. *Marketing Intelligence and Planning*.29(1): 39–48.
67. Sarkees, M. 2011. Understanding the links between technological opportunism, marketing emphasis and firm performance: Implications for B2B. *Industrial Marketing Management*.40(5): 785–795.
68. Sharakhina, L. V., Girenkov, A., Skvortsova, V., & Glitsman, K. 2018. Brand communication tools transformation in digital society. *Proceedings of the 2018 IEEE Communication Strategies in Digital Society Workshop, ComSDS 2018*.2018-Janua: 57–60.

69. Subramanian, K. 2017. Impact of Packaging in Self Service Marketing. *Innternational Journal of Scientific Progress and Research (Ijspr)*.93(March): Pages 60-66.
70. Tiago, M. T. P. M. B., & Veríssimo, J. M. C. 2014. Digital marketing and social media: Why bother? *Business Horizons*.57(6): 703–708.
71. Tiago, M. T., & Tiago, F. 2012. Revisiting the Impact of Integrated Internet Marketing on Firms' Online Performance: European Evidences. *Procedia Technology*.5: 418–426.
72. Tsiotsou, R. H., & Vlachopoulou, M. 2011. Understanding the effects of market orientation and e-marketing on service performance. *Marketing Intelligence and Planning*.29(2): 141–155.
73. Vatash, P. 2018. 2018 Digital Trends Digital Intelligence Briefing (White Paper). *2018 Digital Trends*.
74. Wang, S., Mao, J. Y., & Archer, N. 2012. On the performance of B2B e-markets: An analysis of organizational capabilities and market opportunities. *Electronic Commerce Research and Applications*.11(1): 59–74.
75. We, K. 2016. The What , Why and How of Digital Transformation. *digital marketing institute*.
76. Yadav, M., Joshi, Y., & Rahman, Z. 2015. Mobile Social Media: The New Hybrid Element of Digital Marketing Communications. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*.189: 335–343.
77. Yamakami, T. 2013. Mood-based e-commerce: A new approach for sub-personality-based marketing. *IEEE*.353–357.
78. Yan, K. Q., Wang, S. C., Wang, S. S., & Lin, Y. P. 2011. Application of data mining for enterprise digital marketing strategy making. *Proceedings - 2011 3rd International Conference on Communications and Mobile Computing, CMC 2011*.509–512.
79. Yang, J., Yao, C., Ma, W., & Chen, G. 2010. A study of the spreading scheme for viral marketing based on a complex network model. *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications*.389(4): 859–870.
80. Zhang, J. X., Zhang, H., de Pablos, P. O., & Sun, Y. 2014. Editorial preface: Challenges and foresights of global virtualworlds markets. *Journal of Global Information Technology Management*.17(2): 69–73.
81. Zhang, Y., Wang, Z., & Xia, C. 2010. Identifying key users for targeted marketing by mining online social network. *24th IEEE International Conference on Advanced Information Networking and Applications Workshops, WAINA 2010*.644–649.
82. Zhou, M., Dresner, M., & Windle, R. 2009. Revisiting feedback systems: Trust building in digital markets. *Information and Management*.46(5): 279–284.

Prof. Sanjay Bhāle is MSc (Applied Chemistry), MBA (Chemical sales & Marketing), PhD and in academics for 12 years. Before joining academics, he was in corporate for around 11 years in business development, production, chemical and information & communication technology. He has handled research as well all these years. He is Phd guide in Pune University (SPPU) and Symbiosys International University. He has published / presented research papers in national and international publications and conferences. His domain of research is strategy management, sustainable economic development, business ethics & corporate governance and geopolitics.

Sachin Mutha is presently working as a business and entrepreneurship domain consultant and content marketing practitioner and also as a research scholar of Indira Institute of Management (affiliated to Savitribai Phule Pune University, India). He is a founder member of Merops Consulting House Private Limited.

He is a unique combination of skills in 6 sigma, Business excellence practices, digital engagements, content marketing and creative strategy. He has a rich, multi-functional corporate working and entrepreneurship experience of 21+ years. You can visit his blog at <https://contentmakes.com>.