Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry (TOJQI) Volume 11, Issue 4, October 2020: 1311-1323

An Insight into the Compensation and Performance Appraisal Practices in Schools – A Systematic Review and Agenda for Further Research

Rajeev Sharma¹, Sahera Fatima¹ and Nisha Jha³

¹Institute of Business Management, Mangalayatan University, Aligarh, UP ²Department of Library & Information Science, Mangalayatan University, Aligarh, UP ³Faculty of Business Management & Commerce, Usha Martin University, Ranchi, Jharkhand Email: rajeev.sharma@mangalayatan.edu.in

Abstract

HR policy and practices in schools, as significant factors to teacher effectiveness and student performances, have been research interest to scholars across nations for quite some time. Among various HR practices, compensation and performance appraisal practices in school education sector have also gained much research interest, as these practices are found to have impact on job satisfaction, employee motivation, retention and teacher effectiveness, all of which are crucial for student performances. This paper is a systematic review of the research carried out in the areas of compensation and performance appraisal practices in the school sector. The paper attempts to provide insights into the research and findings in this study area. The researcher has also drawn an agenda for future research in this direction.

Key words: School HR practices, compensation and benefits, performance appraisal, school education sector

1. Introduction

1.1 HR Practices in Schools

Any country that aims to gain a competitive advantage or be on par with global standards should work on maintaining academic standards. In order to build confidence, nations should work on maintaining quality of educational institutions (Dauda and Singh, 2017). School policymakers intending to enhance teaching, majorly work on improvising instructional programs like time schedules, pedagogy and curriculum. However, there is a general lack of attention on behalf of the school administrators with respect to Human Resource Management Practices (HRP) that can support the changes in instructional programs. In fact, HR practices play quite a significant role in educational institutions (Kaçmaza and Serinkan, 2014). Hence, it is worthwhile to get an insight of HR practices in schools because building a team of qualified and committed facultyimpacts instructional quality directly or indirectly (Kwan, 2009).

Human resource (HR) functions in schools are equally diverse and complex as those in business organizations (Kwan, 2009). Researchers majorly focussed on understanding how HR practices impact employee performance of organizations. The studies also included HR practices of educational institutions and gave insights on how such practices affect educational excellence. However, there still exists a perceived gap in many organizations, between planning and

implementing of HR practices (Dauda and Singh, 2017). Since schools seldom have HR units and the managements are preoccupied with student and academic matters, it is imperative for the academic leaders to possess the ability to carry out HR functions effectively in order to motivate and maintain a team of efficient teachers (Kwan, 2009). As per the research suggestion made by Dauda and Singh (2017), it is important to study the perceptions of teachers of HR practices in their schools in order to establish a link between HRP and organizational effectiveness. The research should also focus on identifying those HR practices that have positive impact on the performance of the employees (Dauda and Singh, 2017),

1.2 Research Objectives

The objective of this study is to explore the research carried out across various countries on compensation and performance appraisal practices in the school sector and analyse their impact on the teacher and organizational effectiveness. The aim is also to identify research gaps and draw agenda for further research in this direction.

1.3. Methodology

This review study has primarily focussed on finding patterns from the previous studies. The researcher has adapted inductive reasoning approach in which information has been collected and observations made through previously carried out researches based on which, inferences have been drawn.

The current review study has used a structured review approach. Structured review is referred to as a domain-based research review that is based specifically on theories, methods of carrying out research and constructs that give insightful data to the readers. The information in such structured research review articles is classically presented in systematic and well-designed tables (Paul and Criado, 2020).

2. Literature Review

2.1 HR Practices

Human resource management (HRM) can be referred to all the activities of the organization that are intended to attract, develop and retain manpower having right skills and knowledge needed to achieve organizational effectiveness (Kwan, 2009). HRM is an important part of organizational strategies and is crucial for attaining competitive advantage. The way employees are treated in an organization impacts the performance and effectiveness of the organization (Robbins and Coulter, 2012). The impact of HR practices and policies on organizational effectiveness has been a study interest for researchers (Rafiei and Davari, 2015).

2.2. HR Practices in Schools

HR practices in schools can be generally referred to as the practices pertaining to recruitment, training and development and retention of high-quality teachers who can enhance student achievement through effectively conducting instructional programmes (Heneman III and Milanowski, 2004).Research has acknowledged the potential of HR management in enhancing student performances through teacher engagement, motivation and empowerment(Rafiei and Davari, 2015). International Labour Organization's handbook of good HR practices says the teachers working under enlightened and equitable HR practices and policies not only deliver better education

but also retain in the profession longer. This eases the education managers of the challenges and costs of employee turnover (Handbook of good human resource practices in the teaching profession, 2012).Kwan (2009) worked on perceptions of HR practices of beginner teachers in Hong Kong and identified six dimensions to school HR practices. The six dimensions are recruitment and selection, induction, training and development, performance management, work environment, rewards and recognition, compensation and benefits. ILOtoo recognised the significance of structured HR policies and practices with respect to recruitment, retention, proper work environment and providing professional support to teachers. The Sectoral Activities Department of ILO has published a handbook in 2012 to provide guidance to create a decent work agenda for the teaching professionals across the world.

It is evident from the above section that HR practices significantly impact organizational efficiency and effectiveness. However, in education sector, HR practices and policies were not well structured even in developed nations till recent past. For example, a study on Virginian schools in 90's found they neither had a written recruitment policy nor a well-structured training programme for recruiters (Palombo, 1995). Palombo suggested schools to evaluate their recruitment practices if they wanted to meet their recruitment objectives. In Columbia, it was found that progressive school leaders faced challenges with teacher development and evaluation practices (Beall, 1997). The study also found that teachers were hardly satisfied with their compensation, growth and relationship with their leaders. Most of the teachers were keen on professional development and felt the school should support them financially for further studies, encourage workshops and conferences and should give them enough time to collaborate with colleagues.

In the year 2004, Heneman III and Milanowski extensively studied HRM practices in schools to gain insights on if and how they are correlated to the teacher and students' performances. The study, carried out at Wisconsin-Madison University, presented a framework of school HR practices that are aligned to performance competency model of teachers that in turn impacted student achievements. The eight HR practices identified by the researchers include recruitment and selection, orientation, employee mentoring, support in professional development, compensation practices, performance management and instructional leadership. The study, carried out at two school districts, Cincinnati and Washoe County, found empirical evidence of correlation between student achievements and teacher competencies. The qualitative research was initially carried out using their HR alignment model to study the teacher competencies. The framework acted as an teacher evaluation system that was based on standards. The districts adapted other HR practices later and the new practices were aligned to the competency model to evaluate teacher performance. The research found no strategic plan and alignment existed on in isolated spurts of the HR practice areas identified. Heneman III and Milanowski argued that the HR alignment model framed by them could be used as a strategic template to design and implement an aligned system of HR management in schools (Heneman III and Milanowski, 2004).

The review of literature shows that researchers across the world have been keen on understanding the impact of various HR practices in school education sector. The current study is a critical review of the research carriedout on two significant dimensions of HR practices - compensation and benefits; performance appraisal practices in school education sector.

3. Compensation and Benefits Practices in Schools

Compensation refers to the salary offered to the teachers. While compensation refers to the salary or remuneration of the teachers, benefits are the fringe benefits. ILO defines benefits as the 'Financial

or non-financial compensation related to employment in addition to base salary, such as allowances for housing, transport, health care, insurance, retirement, day care, sick leave or other forms of social protection, funding of education, etc.' (Handbook of good human resource practices in the teaching profession, 2012).

A review of research suggests compensation and benefits given to teachers in schools to have impact on various outcomes including employee satisfaction, work engagement and teacher retention. ILO refers to retention as the ability of an organization or an education system to retain its teaching and non-teaching staff through retention strategies (Handbook of good human resource practices in the teaching profession, 2012).

Arnold (1984) studied the impact of salary incentives on retention of qualified teachers to educationally impacted schools in Los Angeles. He studied 219 Racially Isolated Minority Schools (RIMS), designated as Educationally Impacted Schools, in Los Angeles. He studied the impact of the incentives provided by The Urban Classroom Teacher Program UCTP) on the recruitment, quality and stability of teachers in Educationally Impacted Schools. UCTP was a program developed by the Los Angeles Unified School District and offered incentives to the teachers who took up teaching assignments in RIMS. The researcher collected data by developing a five-year profile for each of the 102 schools that included three pre-program years and first two years of the UCTP. Analysis of the research data indicated a positive impact of the UCTP incentives in attracting and retaining the qualified teachers to the Educationally Impacted Schools. Further, the incentives not only helped in improving the racial composition of the teachers but also motivated the volunteer teachers to commit additional two and a half hours every week to enhance the quality of education program of RIMS (Arnold, 1984).

Chandra (2015) reviewed how contract teachers in India are appointed in India, their salary structure and training given. He argued that the compensation and working conditions and lack of sufficient training of contract teachers in India negatively impacts their morale, motivation and commitment to teaching in long term. The researcher argued this will have potentially serious implications on the quality of education. To support this argument, the researcher presented a synthesis of the literature on how teachers are prepared in the United States so as to analyze how such knowledge can better inform the debate on contract teachers in India.

Colson and Satterfield (2018) examined strategic compensation of teachers impacted their retention in a voluntary participation plan of Tennessee Value Added Assessment System (TVAAS). They conducted ex-post-facto research utilizing a quantitative quasi-experimental-method approach to investigate teacher retention rates. The findings showed no significant difference in the retention of the highly effective teachers whether compensated by strategic compensation plan or traditional salary schedule. It was concluded that the strategic compensation plan of the school district had no additional influence on the retention of the highly effective teachers.

Britton and Propper (2016) studied how school productivity is impacted by teacher pay. The researchers exploited the wage regulation in England to examine how the pay impacts the school performance. They used the data, collected through several administrative sources, on over 3000 schools employing around two lakh teachers. The analysis of the data revealed that teachers do respond to the pay and the performance of the schools that pay wages below the market rate to the teachers is adversely affected.

In a Washington based study, Cowan and Goldhaber (2018) studied the impact of teacher incentive policy that awards a financial bonus to teachers who are certified by the National Board in high poverty schools. Through a regression discontinuity design, the study found the proportion of

certified teachers was increased in bonus-eligible schools through bonus policy by an improvement in hiring, increased certification rates of incumbent teachers and reducing employee turnover.

Researcher	Year	Area of study	Methodology	Findings	Country
Arnold	1984	Impact of salary incentives on retention of qualified teachers to educationally impacted schools in Los Angeles	The researcher collected data by developing a five- year profile for each of the 102 schools that included three pre-program years and first two years of the Urban Classroom Teacher Program (UCTP) on educationally impacted schools.	Analysis of the research data indicated a positive impact of the UCTP incentives in attracting and retaining the qualified teachers to the Educationally Impacted Schools. Further, the incentives not only helped in improving the racial composition of the teachers but also motivated the volunteer teachers to commit additional two and a half hours every week to enhance the quality of education program of Racially Isolated Minority Schools.	Los Angeles, USA
Chandra (2015).	2015	Review of appointment, compensation and training given to contract teachers	Review of procedures of recruitment, compensation and training of contract teachers		India

Table –1: Review of research on compensation practices in schools

Britton and Propper	2016	Impact of teacher pay on school roductivity in England	The researchers used the data, collected through several administrative sources, on over 3000 schools employing around two lakh teachers.	The analysis of the data revealed that teachers do respond to the pay and the performance of the schools that pay wages below the market rate to the teachers is adversely affected	England
Colson and Satterfield	2018	Impact of strategic compensation of teachers on their retention in a voluntary participation plan of Tennessee Value Added Assessment System (TVAAS).	research utilizing a quantitative quasi- experimental- method approach to investigate	The findings showed no significant difference in the retention of the highly effective teachers whether compensated by strategic compensation plan or traditional salary schedule. It was concluded that the strategic compensation plan of the school district had no additional influence on the retention of the highly effective teachers.	Tennessee, USA
Cowan and Goldhaber	2018	Impact of teacher incentive policy that awards a financial bonus to teachers who are certified by National Board in high poverty schools.	Regression discontinuity design	The study found the proportion of certified teachers was increased in bonus-eligible schools through bonus policy by an improvement in hiring, increased certification rates of incumbent teachers and reducing employee turnover	Washington, USA

4. Performance Appraisal Practices in Schools

Appraisal is a method by which a teacher 's job performance is evaluated, as part of assessing teaching effectiveness or as part of guiding and managing career development (Handbook of good human resource practices in the teaching profession, 2012).Performance appraisal is a systematic process of evaluating job-related characteristics that is done by a qualified person periodically. This is done to assess the capability of personnel in performing the potential tasks and understand their productivity thereby making sound HR decisions (Reda, 2010). Performance appraisal has both value and benefits in evaluation and development of employees' effectiveness (Flaniken, 2009). In an analytical study carried out in Millenium school in Louisville by Reda (2010) on employee performance appraisal system, it is found the teachers and supervisors perceived performance appraisal as a tool for training and development and employee motivation for better performance. He found both supervisors and subordinates agreed performance appraisal would have a positive impact on overall school quality and performance through enhancing employee performance. However, he also found that only the supervisors were satisfied with the performance appraisal system while the subordinates were either uncertain or dissatisfied with it. In addition, employees also felt the dimensions on which the employees are evaluated were not most relevant to their jobs. Further, both supervisors and employees felt the ratings given to employees were objective.

Flaniken (2009) studied performance appraisal practices in Christian colleges and universities in the United States. He conducted an online survey and found that while staff performance appraisal in Christian colleges and universities was in very high usage, there was significant dissatisfaction among the employees with the appraisal process. The reasons for the dissatisfaction included lack of support from the leadership for appraisal process, lack of accountability of supervisors for completion of process in time and lack of training to the supervisors for conducting performance appraisal.

Another 2009 study based in the Southeast United States worked on determining the effectiveness of performance appraisal programs of faculty of higher education.

Rector (2009) intended to know how faculty perceive various areas of performance appraisal program in six areas; evaluation purpose, criteria for evaluating faculty, teaching performance as an approach of evaluation, research performance as an approach of evaluation, use of faculty evaluation program. While the survey revealed a majority of the faculty to be satisfied with the overall evaluation process, close to 12% respondents were found to be very much dissatisfied with it. However, the survey result for each area of evaluation program mentioned above varied. The researcher recommended individual institutions to replicate the study specifically for each institute to strengthen the evaluation program. It was also recommended that institutions should revaluate the programs, take all the stake-holders into consideration while redesigning the performance appraisal programs, provide in-service training to institutional leadership to conduct evaluation procedure, make faculty members knowledgeable about the area and also involve them in the process of evaluation. The researcher recommended carrying out further and more specific research in each of the six areas of the appraisal program mentioned above. He also recommended conducting similar studies on larger sample size and geographical areas to find out if the research results can be generalized (Rector, 2009).

Performance appraisal can be applied in many useful ways in organizations. An interesting application of performance appraisal is to use it for leadership development. For example, 360-degree feedback, one of the modern techniques of performance appraisal, aims at increasing self-awareness of leaders' by throwing light on how supervisors, peers and subordinates perceive their leader's strengths and areas that need improvement and behavioral patterns (Herbert, 2012). Another

good example is application of appreciative inquiry in leadership development programs. Johnson & Leavitt (2001) defined appreciative inquiry as a tool that focuses on learning from success and can be used for organizational transformation. Rather than challenges and deficits, appreciative inquiry focuses on what and why something works well and how success can be extended throughout the organization. Research has shown that appreciative inquiry gives an easier forum to subordinates for giving feedback and provides leaders with affirming feedback. Hence it is a value addition to the 360-degree feedback process (Herbert, 2012).

While it is generally agreed that performance appraisal can be used in many ways, (Herbert, 2012), some studies have shown that the perception of usefulness of performance appraisal varies with different levels of employees. For example, a 2010 study conducted in a Louiseville school explored employees' attitudes towards the performance appraisal (PA) system in terms of its value, purposes, key aspects, its fairness and application of the results. The researcher conducted a survey by placing survey forms in mail boxes of 70 employees of Millenium school, which they filled and dropped in a designated box. Analysis of the data collected revealed that while both supervisors and subordinates positively agreed on the value and purposes of PA, they were split in their opinion on the parameters of appraisal, objectivity of ratings and application of the results (Reda, 2010).

Katiyal (2013) conducted a comparative study on HRD practices between schools affiliated to Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE) and Madhya Pradesh Board of Secondary Education (MPBSE) in India. She conducted an extensive survey on 312 male and female teachers, of both CBSE and MPBSE, having various qualification levels, age and experience levels. It was found the age of the teachers significantly affects their perception of performance and reward system. The younger teachers want a systematic and fair appraisal process that gives opportunity for promotions and professional growth. However, more experienced teachers did not appear to be keen on this but were more concerned with the HRD climate of the school and insisted on cordial relations between and among the principal and teachers. This concern was found more among female teachers whereas male teachers were more career-oriented. They also appeared to be quite resistant to change. It was also found that senior teachers were most professional with their jobs. The perception towards job security increased with qualification. Younger teachers were more enthusiastic with structured HRD practices whereas more experienced teachers were resistant to any such change. Teachers' income was also found to play an important role in perception of HRD practices - lesser the income, stronger the perception of HRD practices. Further, it was found that CBSE teachers had better perception of HRD practices than MPBSE teachers. It was also found that government school teachers were aware of HRD practices as they have an online HRD cell. Private school teachers had very little awareness about HRD practices. Coming to the competitive environment, the researcher found that government schools hardly had any competitive environment and most of the teachers were least interested in personal development, which was quite opposite in private schools. The researcher attributed this to the job security in the government sector. Training techniques and their effectiveness were found to be the best in CBSE affiliated private schools where the work environment is highly competitive. CBSE Kendriya Vidyalayas conducts intensive selection process and the teachers had better perception of HRD practices and Career Planning and Development (CPD). The researcher attributed this to the direct link between CPD and promotion and salary hike. The researcher concluded that all the schools were good in some or the other HRD practice but no school had adopted overall HRD practices very well for its teachers (Katiyal, 2013).

Nandamuri (2014) critically appraised the secondary school teachers' appraisal system in India. He conducted a survey on 188 teachers in Krishna district of Andhra Pradesh to collect primary data. The research found while the public sector schools were not practicing any formal appraisal activity, private unaided school managements were majorly implementing their own systems. It was further

found that the type of school was strongly associated with the teacher preference for an integrated appraisal system.

Researcher/s	Year	Area of Study	Methodology	Findings	Country
Flaniken	2009	Performance appraisal practices in Christian colleges and universities in the United States	Quantitative method of data collection through an online survey	While staff performance appraisal in Christian colleges and universities was in very high usage, there was significant dissatisfaction among the employees with the appraisal process due to lack of support from the leadership for appraisal process, lack of accountability of supervisors for completion of process in time and lack of training to the supervisors for conducting performance appraisal.	United States
Rector	2009	Faculty perception of effectiveness of performance appraisal programs of faculty of higher education.	Quantitative study through survey	While a majority of the faculty were found to be satisfied with the overall evaluation process, close to 12% respondents were found to be very much dissatisfied with it. However, the survey result varied with different areas of evaluation.	
Reda	2010	Employees' attitudes	The researcher conducted a	Both supervisors and subordinates	Louiseville, USA

Table –2: Research review on performance appraisal in schools

		towards the performance appraisal (PA) system in terms of value, purposes, key aspects, fairness and application of its results	survey by placing survey forms in mail boxes of 70 employees of Millenium school, which they filled and dropped in a designated box.	positively agreed on the value and purposes of PA, they were split in their opinion on the parameters of appraisal, objectivity of ratings and application of the results	
Herbert	2012	Using of appreciative inquiry as a feedback process for leaders through the 360 degree survey	Qualitative study at a Protestant Church in Virginia having 1500 member strength in which two senior leaders were evaluated by subordinates.	Research has shown that appreciative inquiry gives an easier forum to subordinates for giving feedback and provides leaders with affirming feedback. Hence it is a value addition to the 360-degree feedback process	Virginia, USA
Katiyal	2013	Comparative study on HRD practices between schools affiliated to Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE) and Madhya Pradesh Board of Secondary Education (MPBSE) in India.	Quantitative approach through extensive survey on 312 male and female teachers, of both CBSE and MPBSE, having various qualification levels, age and experience levels.	Age of the teachers significantly affects their perception of performance and reward system. The younger teachers want a systematic and fair appraisal process that gives opportunity for promotions and professional growth. The perception of job security increased with experience. The perception of HRD practices of CBSE teachers was better than MPBSE teachers	Madhya Pradesh, India
Nandamuri	2014	Critical appraisal of the secondary	Researcher conducted a survey on 188	The research found the public sector schools were not	

	school teachers' appraisal system in India	Krishna of Pradesh	district Andhra	formal appraisal activity and private unaided school	
--	--	--------------------------	--------------------	--	--

5. Summary and Conclusion

The review of the research has found that compensation and benefits and performance appraisal practices have been significant areas of interest for the researchers studying HR practices in the school sector since as early as 1980's. However, the research area gained further momentum in the current century. Various studies on compensation and performance appraisal have been carried out in schools in Asia, Europe and USA with major focus on impact of compensation and benefits and performance appraisal practices on the teacher satisfaction, retention and student effectiveness. In USA, it was found as early as 1984 that incentives motivated the employees to work for additional hours. Later studies found that compensation does matter to the teachers and lack of proper compensation practices leads to employee dissatisfaction. While a Tennessee based study found that highly effective teachers are not impacted by whether or not a structured compensation practice is in place, a Washington based study found bonus does motivate the teachers. In the Christian schools in USA, the appraisal system has been in high usage but the staff was dissatisfied with the system due to lack of leadership support in terms of accountability, time and training the appraiser. In India, younger teachers were found to be more appreciative of appraisal and reward system. It is also found that there is a difference between the appraisal systems of public and private schools. The teachers and the supervisors agreed upon the effectiveness of a good performance appraisal system. The 360 degrees appraisal was found to be a value addition in Virginia in USA.

6. Research Gaps and Recommendations for Further Studies

The review finds significant amount of research has been carried out on compensation and appraisal practices in the school sector. However, there still are gaps in the research in this area as listed hereunder.

- 1. An interesting area could be to find out if compensation and benefits practices of schools have any impact on the teacher effectiveness.
- 2. Another area that needs research attention is the fringe benefits given to the teachers. It should also be studied teachers' perceptions towards fringe benefits. The insights in this area would help in making compensation and benefits strategies.

- 3. The third area that requires attention is the variable pay structure and how teachers perceive it.
- 4. It may also be studied if variable pay has any effect on teacher performance.
- 5. There is also scope of studying the impact of fringe benefits on employee satisfaction in schools.
- 6. With respect to the performance appraisal process, it is worth studying various schools' performance appraisal methods so as to find out the best practices in schools.
- 7. Effectiveness of performance appraisal process on teachers' professional growth could also be a good area of study.
- 8. Comparative studies can be carried out on performance appraisal practices in public, private and aided schools
- 9. Effect of 360 degrees performance appraisal should be studied extensively in schools governed by public and private managements.

Bibliography

- 1. Arnold, A., 1984. The Effect of Incentive Pay on Educationally Impacted Schools in the Los Angeles Unified School District. Doctoral Dissertation. Pepperdine University.
- 2. Beall, J., 1997. Strategic Leadership of Independent Schools: The Recruitment, Compensation, and Development of Teachers. Doctoral Dissertation. Columbia University.
- 3. Britton, J. and Propper, C., 2016. Teacher pay and school productivity: Exploiting wage regulation. Journal of Public Economics, 133, pp.75-89.
- 4. Chandra, M., 2015. The implications of contract teaching in India: A review. Policy Futures in Education, 13(2), pp.247-259.
- 5. Colson, T. and Satterfield, C., 2018. The effects of strategic compensation on teacher retention. Power and Education, 10(1), pp.92-104.
- 6. Cowan, J. and Goldhaber, D., 2018. Do bonuses affect teacher staffing and student achievement in high poverty schools? Evidence from an incentive for national board-certified teachers in Washington State. Economics of Education Review, 65, pp.138-152.
- 7. Dauda, Y. and Singh, G., 2017. Review of Integrating HRM Best Practices for Academic Quality in Higher Educational Institutions. International Journal of Applied Environmental Sciences, 12(12), pp.2037-2047.
- 8. Flaniken, F., 2009. Performance Appraisal Systems in Higher Education: An Exploration of Christian Institutions. Doctoral Dissertation. University of Central Florida.
- 9. Heneman III, H. and Milanowski, A., 2004. Alignment of Human Resource Practices and Teacher Performance Competency. Peabody Journal of Education, 79(4), pp.108-125.
- 10. Herbert, A., 2012. Using Appreciative Inquiry in the 360-degree Survey Feedback Process for Leaders. Master's Degree Thesis. Pepperdine University.
- 11. Johnson, G. and Leavitt, W., 2001. Building on Success: Transforming Organizations through an Appreciative Inquiry. *Public Personnel Management*, 30(1), pp.129-136.
- Kaçmaza, R. and Serinkan, C., 2014. Human resource management practices in international sebat educational schools. In: 5th World Conference on Educational Sciences - WCES 2013. Turkey: Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, pp.4809 – 4813.
- 13. Katiyal, D., 2013. A Comparative Study of HRD Practices of Central and Madhya Pradesh Board of Education. Doctoral Dissertation. Devi Ahilya Vishwavidyalaya, Indore.
- 14. Kwan, P., 2009. Beginning teachers' perceptions of school human resource practices. Asia Pacific Journal of Education, 29(3), pp.373-386.
- 15. Leur, A., 2012. Handbook Of Good Human Resource Practices In The Teaching Profession. 1st ed. Geneva: ILO, p.iii.

- 16. Nandamuri, P., 2014. An Appraisal of the Teacher Appraisal System. ANVESHAK-International Journal of Management, 3(5), p.114.
- 17. Palombo, L., 1995. Recruitment Practices of Virginia Public School Divisions and the Effectiveness of Selected Sources in the Recruitment of Teachers. Doctoral Dissertation. The College of William and Mary in Virginia.
- 18. Paul, J. and Criado, A., 2020. The art of writing literature review: What do we know and what do we need to know?. International Business Review, 29(4), p.101717.
- 19. Rafiei, N. and Davari, F., 2015. The Role of Human Resources Management on Enhancing the Teaching Skills of Faculty Members. *Materia Socio Medica*, 27(1), pp.35-38.
- 20. Rector, J., 2009. Faculty Perceptions Of Faculty Evaluation Programs At Selected Private Colleges/Universities In The Southeast United States.. Doctoral Dissertation. The University of Tennessee, Chattanooga.
- 21. Reda, R., 2010. An Analysis Of The Employee Performance Appraisal System In The Millenium School. Master of Science. University of Louisville.
- 22. Robbins, S. and Coulter, M., 2012. Management. 11th ed. New Jersey: Pearson Education, Inc., pp.312-313.