Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry (TOJQI)

Volume 12, Issue 5, June 2021: 1144 - 1155

Research Article

Study of various dimensions of Professional Commitment among secondary school teachers in relation to their gender and Institutional Effectiveness

¹Dr. Amit Kauts, ²Mrs. Gifty Arora

Abstract

The current study was attempted to bring in limelight the differences in professional commitment of teachers in high effective institutions and low effective institutions in case of its five dimensions i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values." 174 CBSE Schools of Punjab State were taken as a sample. 10 teachers teaching secondary classes from each institution were selected randomly. Institutional Effectiveness Scale is administered to every institution. After that by applying Kelley's 27% criterion, no. of high and low effective schools was 47 respectively. The study found that in high effective institutions, teachers are highly committed towards learner, society, own profession, academic excellence and basic human values than their counterparts in low effective institutions. Moreover, it was found that female teachers are highly committed towards learner, society, own profession, academic excellence and basic human values than male teachers. Further, results revealed that male teachers are less committed than female teachers in both high effective and low effective institutions.

Keywords: Professional commitment, Teachers, Institutional effectiveness

Introduction

Teachers play an ineluctable role not merely as a transmitter of knowledge but a facilitator of knowledge also. The quality of teaching depends on the level of teachers' involvement to a great extent. His or her involvement in teaching makes him a committed teacher. Professional commitment is defined as the psychological link between an individual and his profession that is based on an affective reaction to that profession (Lee, Carswell and Allen, 2000)¹.

A committed teacher can play a role of manager, leader and organizer of group activities and builder of pupil's character. His/Her commitment towards teaching profession can make the institution effective and efficient. The institutes where there are committed teachers excel well in the society. The committed teachers set their own example before the students which inspire the students to achieve more, that in turn, make the institution effective.

¹Professor, Department of Education, Guru Nanak Dev University, Amritsar

²Research Scholar, Department of Education, Guru Nanak Dev University, Amritsar

Professional Commitment

Kadyschuk (1997) indicated that there was presence of the three dimensions of teacher commitment as well as the presence of simultaneous commitments of more than one dimension². Rahman & Hanafiah (2002) revealed that there is significant relationship between commitment to profession and the affective, continuance, and normative dimensions of commitment to the organization³. Bagraim (2003) found that South African actuaries are highly committed to their profession⁴. Magnan (2010) revealed positive relationship exists between professional commitment and professional development. Moreover, there was positive relationship between perceived organizational support and professional commitment⁵. Aghaei and Savari (2014) indicated that there was a significant and positive relationship between psychological empowerment subscales competence sense, self-determining sense, impact sense, trust sense and professional commitment⁶. Delima (2015) found that level of teachers' professional identity in terms of philosophy of the profession is very high⁷. Ibrahim & Iqbal (2015) found that that teacher professionalism and commitment to teaching profession was satisfactory in general. Teachers in Government high schools for boys in district Charsadda were committed to their teaching profession⁸. Hussen et al. (2016) indicated that teachers' commitment to learning, the community and their profession were low due to low salary, low respect, low attitude towards teaching profession, less motivation and less incentives⁹. Hegazy & AgylAlmaizar (2017) indicated that there was strong positive relationship between professional commitment and job satisfaction¹⁰. Hasanati (2018) found that the quality of work life significantly affects the affective commitment of the profession¹¹. Aslamiah (2019) revealed significant difference exists in teacher's organizational commitment between excellent schools and low achievement schools both in urban and suburban areas in Banjarmasin¹². Tindowen et al. (2020) revealed that secondary school teachers have a high level of professional commitment¹³.

Institutional Effectiveness

Reynolds (1989) found that more effective schools did have smaller class size, more favorable pupil/teacher ratios and were of smaller pupil numbers overall¹⁴. Riddell and Nyagura (1991) found that student achievement is higher when schools have a greater availability of textbooks, a larger proportion of trained teachers and teachers who have taught at that school for a longer period of time¹⁵. Sammons et al. (1995) indicated that process of effective school includes professional leadership, shared vision and goals, a learning environment, concentration on teaching and learning, purposeful teaching, high expectations, positive reinforcement, home-school partnership, and a learning organization ¹⁶. Grover and Singh (2002) found that the factors that appeared to be critical and were having a detrimental impact on student achievement were Lack of material and human resources especially proper classrooms, lack of toilets, teacher absenteeism which was rampant and poor provision of teachers especially in rural areas¹⁷. Mulford (2003) examined School Leaders Changing Roles and Impact on Teacher and School Effectiveness. He found that authority to lead need not be located in the person of the leader but can be dispersed within the school between and among people¹⁸. Ghani et al. (2011) found that excellent schools in Malaysia have better implementation of effective school practices at very often level compared to the excellent schools in Brunei¹⁹. Bolanle (2013) found that secondary school principals in south western Nigeria possessed technical, interpersonal, conceptual and administrative skills. A significant relationship was found between principals' leadership skills and school effectiveness²⁰.

Taniguchi (2015) found that schools that were effective in raising achievement were ineffective in promoting achievement growth, and they were not always effective in reducing repetition, dropout, and transfer rates²¹. Johnson (2016) revealed statistically significant correlations among the different student perceived aspects of school effectiveness²². Ramberg et al. (2018) found that the attributes of school effectiveness contributed to perceived teacher caring among students at higher level²³. Ozgenel (2020) found that school climate predicts school effectiveness²⁴.

Statement of the problem

Study of various dimensions of Professional Commitment among secondary school teachers in relation to their gender and Institutional Effectiveness

Objectives of the study

- 1. To develop a tool for assessing Institutional Effectiveness.
- 2. To study the various dimensions of Professional Commitment of teachers in relation to Institutional Effectiveness and gender of teachers.

Hypotheses of the study

- 1. There exists no significant difference in institutions with high and in the institutions with low effectiveness on the scores of various dimensions of Professional Commitment.
- 2. There exists no significant difference between male and female teachers on the scores of various dimensions of Professional Commitment.
- 3. There exists no significant interaction between institutional effectiveness and gender of teachers on the scores of various dimensions of professional commitment.

Delimitation of the study

- 1. The study has been delimited to the CBSE schools of Jalandhar, Kapurthala, Amritsar, Ludhiana, Gurdaspur and Hoshiarpur districts of Punjab.
- 2. Data has been collected from teachers teaching secondary classes only.

Sample

There are total 1350 CBSE schools in state of Punjab. By applying Cochran's formula for calculating sample size, 174 schools have been selected for the purpose of data collection. Out of these 174 schools, by applying 27% Kelley's criterion, no. of high and low effective schools was 47 respectively. From every school, 10 teachers teaching secondary classes have been selected randomly.

Tools used

- 1. Institutional Effectiveness Scale prepared by the investigator.
- 2. Professional Commitment Scale (Dr. Deepa Sikand, 2014).

Procedure of the study

Institutional Effectiveness has been treated as an independent variable and used for the purpose of classification only. The same design has been replicated on the scores of Professional Commitment which has been studied as dependent variable. For the purpose of present investigation, Institutional Effectiveness Scale was administered to 174 selected CBSE schools. Further, data regarding Professional Commitment were collected from teachers of selected high effective and low effective CBSE schools.

Analysis and interpretation of data

2X2 Analysis of Variance on the Scores of various dimensions of Professional Commitment with regard to Institutional Effectiveness and Gender of the School Teachers

The descriptive statistics (means and standard deviations) for 2x2 ANOVA on various dimensions of Professional Commitment with regard to Institutional Effectiveness and gender have been calculated and are presented below in the Table no.1:

TABLE-1

Dimensions of Professional		High effective	Low effective	Total
Commitment		Institutes	Institutes	
I-Learner	Male	$M_1=65.90$	$M_2 = 36.39$	M = 53.25
		$\sigma = 5.47$	$\sigma = 6.68$	$\sigma = 15.81$
		N= 176	N= 132	N = 308
	Female	M ₃ =69.61	M ₄ =38.01	M=52.71
		$\sigma = 2.87$	$\sigma = 3.70$	$\sigma = 16.12$
		N= 294	N= 338	N= 632
	Total	M=68.22	M=37.56	
		$\sigma = 4.42$	$\sigma = 4.78$	
		N= 470	N= 470	
II-Society	Male	$M_5=64.04$	$M_6=49.55$	M = 57.83
		$\sigma = 4.53$	$\sigma = 6.04$	$\sigma = 8.88$
		N= 176	N= 132	N = 308
	Female	$M_7 = 70.34$	$M_8 = 50.48$	M=59.72
		$\sigma = 2.78$	$\sigma = 3.18$	$\sigma = 10.35$
		N= 294	N= 338	N= 632
		15 (7.00	15. 50.00	
	Total	M=67.98	M=50.22	
		$\sigma = 4.67$	$\sigma = 4.20$	
		N= 470	N= 470	
III-Own Profession	Male	$M_9 = 98.14$	$M_{10}=79.32$	M = 99.07
		$\sigma = 5.11$	$\sigma = 6.64$	$\sigma = 10.98$
		N= 176	N= 132	N = 308

	Female	$M_{11}=101.42$	$M_{12}=85.46$	M=92.88
		$\sigma = 2.09$	$\sigma = 2.56$	$\sigma = 8.32$
		N= 294	N= 338	N = 632
	Total	M=100.19	M=83.73	
		$\sigma = 3.87$	$\sigma = 5.00$	
		N= 470	N = 470	
IV-Attaining Excellence	Male	$M_{13}=70.72$	$M_{14}=54.30$	M = 63.68
		$\sigma = 4.45$	$\sigma = 4.96$	$\sigma = 9.38$
		N= 176	N= 132	N = 308
	Female	$M_{15}=76.39$	M ₁₆ =55.71	M=65.33
		$\sigma = 1.90$	$\sigma = 2.28$	$\sigma = 10.53$
		N= 294	N= 338	N= 632
	Total	M=74.27	M=55.31	
		$\sigma = 4.14$	$\sigma = 3.32$	
		N = 470	N = 470	
V-Basic Human Values	Male	$M_{17}=97.15$	$M_{18}=79.15$	M = 89.43
		$\sigma = 6.05$	$\sigma = 6.37$	$\sigma = 10.85$
		N= 176	N= 132	N = 308
	Female	$M_{19}=100.92$	$M_{20}=85.05$	M=92.43
		$\sigma = 3.08$	$\sigma = 2.42$	$\sigma = 8.38$
		N= 294	N= 338	N= 632
	Total	M=99.51	M=83.39	
		$\sigma = 4.78$	$\sigma = 4.75$	
		N= 470	N= 470	

To analyze the variance in the various dimensions of Professional Commitment with regard to Institutional effectiveness and gender of the teachers, ANOVA has been calculated on the obtained scores and presented below in the Table no. 2:

TABLE- 2

2X2 ANOVA ON THE SCORES OF VARIOUS DIMENSIONS OF PROFESSIONAL COMMITMENT WITH REGARD TO INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS AND GENDER OF THE TEACHERS

Dimensions of Professional Commitment	Source of variation	Sum of Squares	df	MSS	F	p-value
I-Learner	Institutional effectiveness (A)	190345.70	1	190345.70	9821.405	.000*
	Gender (B)	1451.42	1	1451.42	74.89	.000*

	Interaction (AxB)	222.32	1	222.32	11.47	.001*
	Total	2870742	940			
II-Society	Institutional effectiveness (A)	60160.93	1	60160.93	4000.10	.000*
	Gender (B)	2667.30	1	2667.30	177.34	.000*
	Interaction (AxB)	1469.57	1	1469.57	97.71	.000*
	Total	3376519	940			
III-Own Profession	Institutional effectiveness (A)	61661.36	1	61661.36	4118.885	.000*
	Gender (B)	4522.27	1	4522.27	302.08	.000*
	Interaction (AxB)	414.815	1	414.815	27.70	.000*
	Total	8032879	940			
IV-Attaining excellence	Institutional effectiveness (A)	70172.97	1	70172.97	6889.407	.000*
	Gender (B)	2555.35	1	2555.35	250.87	.000*
	Interaction (AxB)	922.61	1	922.61	90.58	.000*
	Total	4044256	940			
V-Basic Human Values	Institutional effectiveness (A)	58480.112	1	58480.112	3318.60	.000*
	Gender (B)	4772.97	1	4772.97	270.85	.000*
	Interaction (AxB)	231.90	1	231.90	13.16	.000*
	Total	7944628	940			

^{*} Significant at the 0.05 level of confidence

MAIN EFFECTS

INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS (A)

It has been reflected from the Table no. 2 that p-value for difference between means of institutions with high effectiveness and institutions with low effectiveness on the scores of teacher commitment, in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" were turned out significant at 0.05 level of confidence. So it suggests that difference in the various dimensions of professional commitment of high effective institutions and low effective institutions is significant. Therefore, Hypothesis (1) namely "There exists no significant difference in institutions with high and in the institutions with low effectiveness on the scores of various dimensions of Professional Commitment" is rejected.

Further the analysis of means from table no. 1 suggest that mean of professional commitment in dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" is significantly higher in institutions with high effectiveness as compared to those with low effectiveness. Thus, in high effective institutions, teachers are highly committed towards learner, society, own profession, academic excellence and basic human values than their counterparts in low effective institutions. Aslamiah (2019) revealed significant difference exists in teacher's organizational commitment between excellent schools and low achievement schools both in urban and suburban areas in Banjarmasin¹².

GENDER (B)

It has been reflected from the Table no. 2 that p-value for difference between means of male and female teachers on the scores of Professional Commitment in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" were turned out significant at 0.05 level of confidence. Therefore, Hypothesis (2) namely "There exists no significant difference between male and female teachers on the scores of various dimensions of Professional Commitment" is rejected.

Further the analysis of means from table no. 1 suggest that mean of professional commitment in dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in case of female teachers is significantly higher as compared to male teachers. Thus, female teachers are highly committed towards learner, society, own profession, academic excellence and basic human values than male teachers. Shukla & Waris (2016) found that female teachers are better than male teachers in terms of professional commitment²⁵.

TWO ORDER INTERACTION (AXB)

INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS (A) X GENDER (B)

It has been shown from the Table no. 2 that p-value for the interaction between the institutional effectiveness and gender of teachers on the scores of Professional Commitment in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" were turned out significant at 0.05 level of confidence. So

it suggests that the interaction between institutional effectiveness and gender of teachers on the scores of various dimensions of Professional Commitment is significant. Therefore, Hypothesis (3) namely "There exists no significant interaction between institutional effectiveness and gender of teachers on the scores of various dimensions of professional commitment" is rejected.

Further, in order to analyze the significance of difference in various cells due to which p-values are found to be significant, t-ratios have been computed and presented in the following Table no.3:

TABLE- 3

t - RATIOS FOR THE DIFFERENCE IN THE MEANS OF VARIOUS CELLS OF DIMENSIONS OF PROFESSIONAL COMMITMENT WITH REGARD TO INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS AND GENDER OF TEACHERS

Dimensions	Cells	D	SE	t-ratio
I-Learner	M_1 - M_2	29.50	0.693	42.54*
	M_1 - M_3	3.71	0.385	9.62*
	M_1 - M_4	27.88	0.408	68.30*
	M_2 - M_3	33.22	0.462	71.81*
	M_2 - M_4	1.62	0.485	3.34*
	M ₃ -M ₄	31.59	0.266	118.56*
II-Society	M ₅ -M ₆	14.49	0.603	24.02*
	M ₅ -M ₇	6.30	0.337	18.66*
	M ₅ -M ₈	13.56	0.344	39.41*
	M ₆ -M ₇	20.79	0.427	48.62*
	M ₆ -M ₈	0.932	0.429	2.169*
	M ₇ -M ₈	19.86	0.239	82.93*
III-Own Profession	M9-M ₁₀	18.81	0.669	28.09*
	M ₉ -M ₁₁	3.28	0.337	9.73*
	M9-M ₁₂	12.68	0.342	37.03*
	M ₁₀ -M ₁₁	22.09	0.427	51.67*
	M ₁₀ -M ₁₂	6.13	0.428	14.32*
	M_{11} - M_{12}	15.96	0.192	83.02*
IV-Attaining	M ₁₃ -M ₁₄	16.42	0.538	30.47*
Excellence	M ₁₃ -M ₁₅	5.66	0.296	19.09*

	M_{13} - M_{16}	15.01	0.297	50.51*
	M ₁₄ -M ₁₅	22.09	0.333	66.21*
	M ₁₄ -M ₁₆	1.41	0.335	4.214*
	M ₁₅ -M ₁₆	20.67	0.169	122.32*
V-Basic Human Values	M_{17} - M_{18}	18.00	0.713	25.24*
	M ₁₇ -M ₁₉	3.77	0.422	8.93*
	M ₁₇ -M ₂₀	12.09	0.376	32.16*
	M ₁₈ -M ₁₉	21.77	0.458	47.51*
	M ₁₈ -M ₂₀	5.90	0.405	14.56*
	M ₁₉ -M ₂₀	15.86	0.219	72.42*

^{*} Significant at the 0.05 level of confidence

It is shown from Table no. 3 that the attained value of t-ratios for the difference between means M_1-M_2 , M_1-M_3 , M_1-M_4 , M_2-M_3 , M_2-M_4 , M_3-M_4 , M_5-M_6 , M_5-M_7 , M_5-M_8 , M_6-M_7 , M_6-M_8 , M_7-M_8 , $M_9-M_9-M_9$, M_9-M_9 , M_{10} , M_9 - M_{11} , M_9 - M_{12} , M_{10} - M_{11} , M_{10} - M_{12} , M_{11} - M_{12} , M_{13} - M_{14} , M_{13} - M_{15} , M_{13} - M_{16} , M_{14} - M_{15} , M_{14} - M_{16} , M_{15} - M_{16} , M_{17} - M_{18} , M_{17} - M_{19} , M_{17} - M_{20} , M_{18} - M_{19} , M_{18} - M_{20} and M_{19} - M_{20} have been turned out significant at the 0.05 level of confidence. Further, the analysis of mean table suggests that the professional commitment of male teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in high effective institutions is higher than the male teachers in low effective institutions. It also suggests that professional commitment of male teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in high effective institutions is lower than the female teachers in high effective institutions. Moreover, it reveals that the professional commitment of female teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in high effective institutions is higher than the female teachers in low effective institutions. It is also clearly shown above that the professional commitment of male teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in low effective institutions is lower than female teachers in high effective institutions. In addition, it reveals that the professional commitment of female teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in high effective institutions is higher than female teachers in low effective institutions.

Discussion on findings

The present study analyzed the professional commitment of teachers in high effective institutes and low effective institutes in case of its five dimensions i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values." It has been observed in the current study that in high effective institutions, teachers are highly committed towards learner, society,

own profession, academic excellence and basic human values than their counterparts in low effective institutions. This result is consistent with the findings of Aslamiah (2019). He revealed significant difference exists in teacher's organizational commitment between excellent schools and low achievement schools both in urban and suburban areas in Banjarmasin¹². It has been further found that female teachers are highly committed towards learner, society, own profession, academic excellence and basic human values than male teachers. The result of this finding is contrary with the result of Shukla & Waris (2016). They found that female teachers are better than male teachers in terms of professional commitment²⁵. Further, the analysis suggests that the professional commitment of male teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner". "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in high effective institutions is higher than the male teachers in low effective institutions. It also suggests that professional commitment of male teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in high effective institutions is lower than the female teachers in high effective institutions. This finding is in tune with results of Habib (2009). He revealed that female secondary school teachers have higher professional commitment as compare as to male secondary school teachers²⁶. Moreover, it reveals that the professional commitment of female teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in high effective institutions is higher than the female teachers in low effective institutions. It is also clearly shown above that the professional commitment of male teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in low effective institutions is lower than female teachers in high effective institutions. Beri & Beri (2016) found that Female teacher educators have higher work motivation as compared to male teacher eduators²⁷. In addition, it reveals that the professional commitment of female teachers in case of dimensions I, II, III, IV and V i.e. "Learner", "Society", "Own profession", "Academic Excellence" and Basic Human Values" in high effective institutions is higher than female teachers in low effective institutions.

REFERENCES

- ¹Lee, K., Carswell, J. J., & Allen, N. J. (2000). A meta-analytic review of occupational commitment: Relations with person and work-related variables. Journal of Applied Psychology, 85, 799-811.
- ²Kadyschuk, R. (1997). Teacher Commitment: A study of the organizational commitment, Professional Commitment, and Union Commitment of teachers in public schools in Saskatchewan. University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon.
- ³Rahman, N.M.A. & Hanafiah, M.H. (2002). Commitment to organization versus commitment to profession: conflict or compatibility? Jurnal Pengurusan, 21, 77-94.
- ⁴Bagraim, J.J. (2003). The Dimensionality of Professional Commitment. SA Journal of Industrial Psychology, 29(2), 6-9.
- ⁵Magnan, A.M.R. (2010). Effects of Professional Commitment and Organizational Context on the Professional Development of Canadian Occupational Therapists. University of Alberta, Alberta.
- ⁶Aghaei, N. & Savari, M. (2014). The relationship between psychological empowerment and professional commitment of selected physical education teachers in Khuzestan province, Iran. European Journal of Experimental Biology, 4(4), 147-155.

- ⁷Delima, V.T. (2015). Professional Identity, Professional Commitment and Teachers' Performance. International Journal of Novel Research in Education and Learning, 2(4), 1-12.
- ⁸ Ibrahim, M. & Iqbal, M. (2015). Teachers' Perceptions of Professional Commitment (Affective, Continuance and Normative Commitment) to Teaching Profession. Journal of Literature, Languages and Linguistics, 11, 36-48.
- ⁹Hussen, A.A., Tegegn, S.A.W. & Teshome, T.Z. (2016). Teachers Professional Commitment towards Students Learning, their Profession and the Community in Eastern Ethiopian Secondary Schools. Journal of Teacher Education and Educators, 5(3), 289-314. Retreived from https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/646630
- Hegazy, H.M.H. & AqylAlmaizar, H. (2017). Relationship between Professional Commitment, Job Satisfaction and Professional Roles' Practice Level of Medical Social Workers. Journal of Sociology and Social Work, 5(2), 139-150. Retreived from http://jsswnet.com/journals/jssw/Vol_5_No_2_December_2017/15.pdf
- ¹¹Hasanati, N. (2018). The Role of Work Life Quality towards Teacher's Professional Commitment. Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research, 231, 653-656.
- ¹²Aslamiah (2019). Teachers Organizational Commitment in Elementary School: A Study in Banjarmasın Indonesia. The Open Psychology Journal, 12, 1-6.
- ¹³Tindowen, D.J., Bautista, J.A., Echalar, H.J. & Parallag, E.S. (2020). Senior High School Teachers' Professional and Organizational Commitment and Their Job Satisfaction. International Journal of Arts Humanities and Social Sciences Studies, 5(9), 142-150.
- ¹⁴Reynolds, D. (1989) The Cardiff Programme an effective school improvement programme based on school effectiveness research. International Journal of Educational Research, 13(7), 800-814.
- ¹⁵Riddell, A.R. & Nyagura, L.M. (1991). What causes differences in achievement in Zimbabwe's Secondary Schools. Population and Human Resources Department, World Bank.
- ¹⁶Sammons, P., Hillman, J. & Mortimore, P. (1995). Key Characteristics of Effective Schools: A Review of School Effectiveness Research. Institute of Education University of London.
- ¹⁷Grover, S. & Singh, N.H. (2002). The Quality of Primary Education: A Case Study of Madurai and Villupuram Districts in Tamil Nadu, India. Harvard Graduate School of Education.
- ¹⁸Mulford, B. (2003). School Leaders: Changing Roles and Impact On Teacher and School Effectiveness. Retrieved from https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/14a2/c33b6214de0305d3d42b0f1416376cf88bc8.pdf
- ¹⁹Ghani, M.F.A., Siraj, S., Radzi, N.M. & Elham, F. (2011). School effectiveness and improvement practices in excellent schools in Malaysia and Brunei. Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences, 15, 1705–1712.
- ²⁰Bolanle, A.O. (2013). Principals' Leadership Skills and School Effectiveness: The Case of South Western Nigeria. World Journal of Education, 3(5), 26-33. doi:10.5430/wje.v3n5p26
- ²¹Taniguchi, K. (2015). Multiple Indicators of School Effectiveness in Rural Malawi: A Multilevel Event History Analysis. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Hiroshima University, Japan.
- ²²Johnson, A.D. (2016). The Relationship Between Student Perceptions of School Effectiveness

- And Student Achievement: Implications for Educational Planning. Educational Planning, 23(2), 31-43.
- ²³Ramberg, J., Laftman, S.B., Almquist, Y.B. & Modin, B. (2018). School Effectiveness and Students' Perceptions of Teacher Caring: A Multilevel Study. Improving Schools, 1–17. doi: 10.1177/1365480218764693 j
- ²⁴Ozgenel, M. (2020). An Organizational Factor Predicting School Effectiveness: School Climate. International Journal of Psychology and Educational Studies, 7(1), 38-50.
- ²⁵Shukla, A.K. & Waris, A. (2016). Professional Commitment of Secondary School Teachers in Relation to Their Gender and Area: A Comparative Study. Global Journal for Research Analysis, 5(7), 264-265.
- ²⁶Habib, H. (2019). Professional Commitment of Secondary School Teachers in Relation to their Self-Efficacy. International Journal of Arts, Science and Humanities, 7(1), 35-38. doi: https://doi.org/10.34293/sijash.v7i1.420
- ²⁷Beri, N. & Beri, A. (2016). Professional Commitment of Teacher Educators In Relation to Work Motivation. International Journal of Research in Humanities, Arts and Literature, 4(1), 45-52.